EUROPEAN ORGANISATION
FOR THE SAFETY OF AIR NAVIGATION

EUROCONTROL

SAFETY REGULATION COMMISSION DOCUMENT
(SRC DOC)

SRC DOCUMENT 13

ASSESSMENT OF THE EATM 'EUROPEAN MANUAL OF PERSONNEL LICENSING – AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS' AS AN ACCEPTABLE MEANS OF COMPLIANCE WITH ESARR 5

Edition	:	**2.0**
Edition Date	:	**01 August 2007**
Status	:	**Released Issue**
Distribution	:	**General Public**
Category	:	**SRC Document**

SAFETY REGULATION COMMISSION

F.2   DOCUMENT CHARACTERISTICS

TITLE			
SRC Document 13 – Assessment of the EATM 'European Manual of Personnel Licensing-Air Traffic Controllers' as a Means of Compliance with ESARR 5			
Document Identifier		**Reference**	SRC DOC 13
srcdoc13_e2.0_ri_web		**Edition Number**	2.0
		Edition Date	01-08-2007

Abstract

Part 1 of this document assess to what extent the EATM "European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01, Edition 1.0, 8 September 2000), implemented with the support of its related "Guidance on Implementation" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2001), complies with ESARR 5, Edition 1.0.

Part 2 assesses to what extent the EATM "European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01, Edition 2.0, 14 June 2004), implemented with the support of its related "Guidance on Implementation" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2001), complies with ESARR 5, Edition 2.0.

Keywords

ESARR 5	Designated Authority	Student ATCO
Competency	OJTI	ICAO
Air Traffic Controller	Means of Compliance	ATM Staff
Provider of Air Traffic Services		

Contact Person(s)	**Tel**	**Unit**
Bogdan BRAGUTA	+32 2 729 91 67	DG/SRU

DOCUMENT INFORMATION					
Status		**Distribution**		**Category**	
Working Draft	☐	General Public	☑	Safety Regulatory Requirement	☐
Draft Issue	☐	Restricted EUROCONTROL	☐	Requirement Application Document	☐
Proposed Issue	☐	Restricted SRC	☐	ESARR Advisory Material	☐
Released Issue	☑	Restricted SRC Commissioners	☐	SRC Policy Document	☐
		Restricted SRCCG	☐	SRC Document	☑
		Restricted SRU	☐	Comment / Response Document	☐

COPIES OF SRC DELIVERABLES CAN BE OBTAINED FROM
Safety Regulation Unit   Tel: +32 2 729 51 38 EUROCONTROL   Fax: +32 2 729 47 87 Rue de la Fusée, 96   E-mail: sru@eurocontrol.int B-1130 Bruxelles   Website: www.eurocontrol.int/src

F.3   DOCUMENT APPROVAL

The following table identifies all management authorities who have approved this document.

Authority	Name & Signature	Date
Quality Control (SRU)	***signed by Daniel Hartin*** (Daniel HARTIN)	01.08.2007
Head of Unit (SRU)	***signed by Peter Stastny*** (Peter STASTNY)	01.08.2007
Chairman Safety Regulation Commission (SRC)	***signed by Ron Elder*** (Ron ELDER)	01.08.2007

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

F.4   AMENDMENT RECORD

The following table records the complete history of this document.

Edition No.	Date	Reason for Change	Pages Affected
0.01	19-Sep-01	Creation – First working draft 0.01 produced by SRU following the SRG proposal for section 5 compliance.	All
0.02	01-Oct-01	- SRU update of the compliance including the review of HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01deliverable - Assessment of compliance with the non obligatory provisions - Configuration of the document - Adding Appendix C – Backing Evidence for PMC.	All
0.10	15-Nov-01	Version incorporating modifications agreed by the SRC Expert Panel and further review of the document by SRU as decided at AMC meeting on 4th of October. Edition produced as proposed issue for submission to SRC for review and approval by correspondence.	Sections 4, 5, 6 and 7
0.11	29-Jan-02	Version incorporating modifications to deal with the issues in the comments from EUROCONTROL ASR.	Section 4.1 table 1 & Table 3 – (8/8), Sections 4.2, 4.3.11, 6.2, 7
1.0	30-Jan-02	Version to format the Released Issue. Only quality control changes, no alteration from the text of Ed 0.11 occurred.	-
1.01	21-Mar-07	Creation of Part II. SRU quality review.	All
1.1	29-Mar-07	Document sent to SRC for formal consultation / approval (RFC No. 0704).	-
1.2	11-May-07	Minor changes as a result of SRC consultation.	Appendix B
2.0	01-Aug-07	Document formally issued.	-

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

F.5   CONTENTS

F.6   EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

SRC Document 13 aggregates the outcomes of two different assessments of the EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers against ESARR 5 requirements. The assessments have been validated and completed by SRC Expert Assessment Panels which were formed from EUROCONTROL Member States.

This document is intended to be used as a decision making tool for the SRC to develop its own judgement on the acceptability of the EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers and its Implementation Guidance Material as one possible Means of Compliance with ESARR 5.

It also provides a set of conclusions and recommendations to support the final SRC judgement. The conclusions refer to the compliance of the totality of ESARR 5, but also, as necessary, to the compliance with only a part(s) of ESARR 5. The set of conclusions and recommendations in this document provide the basis to support the statements of compliance that are made available in EAM 5 / AMC (see EAM 5 / AMC 1 and EAM 5 / AMC 2).

The content of Part I of this document is formed by the assessment of the extent to which the "EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01, Edition 1.0, 8 September 2000), implemented with the support of its related "Guidance on Implementation" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2001), complies with ESARR 5 "ATM Services' Personnel", Edition 1.0.

The content of Part II of this document is formed by the assessment of the extent to which the "EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01, Edition 2.0, 14 June 2004), implemented with the support of its related "Guidance on Implementation" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2001), complies with ESARR 5 "ATM Services' Personnel", Edition 2.0.

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

PART 1

Assessment of the EATM 'European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers', Edition 1.0 as a Means of Compliance with ESARR 5, Edition 1.0

1.   INTRODUCTION

The Safety Regulation Commission (SRC) is established by the EUROCONTROL Commission to provide advice in order to ensure, through co-operation between States on safety regulation, consistent high levels of safety in air traffic management (ATM) within the ECAC area.

The purpose of safety regulation is to ensure safety in the public interest. This is achieved by the development of a safety regulatory framework, and its application to the services being regulated. In the case of the SRC, its multi-national role also calls for it to ensure that the agreed regulatory principles are being applied in each nation and by the EUROCONTROL Agency itself.

The competence of ATM personnel, and where applicable their satisfaction of medical requirements, are fundamental elements of safety achievement, and therefore of safety management, in the provision of ATM services. Competence is taken to mean possession of the required level of knowledge, skills, experience and where required, proficiency in English, to permit the safe and efficient provision of ATM service.

ESARR 5 - EUROCONTROL Safety Regulatory Requirements for ATM Services' Personnel - has been elaborated in an area where ICAO SARPS have already existed for a long period of time.

The EUROCONTROL Safety Regulatory Requirement – ATM Services' Personnel stemmed from the need to complement the ICAO Annex 1 Standard and Recommended Practices - SARPs - and to enable the safety aspects of the licence/certificate of competence qualifications to more closely match the air traffic services being provided within ECAC region.

Each State signatory of the Chicago Convention undertakes to keep its own Regulations, its air navigation equipment and operations compliant, as far as possible, with those established by the International Civil Aviation Organisation (ICAO) under the Chicago Convention.

In the above introduced context, the EUROCONTROL Safety Regulation Commission has the task of ensuring the uniform implementation of ESARR 5 across Europe, hence the need for SRC to recognise a number of Means of Compliance to help this uniform implementation of ESARR 5

2. PURPOSE AND SCOPE

The Safety Regulation Commission has approved an internal procedure by which a SRC Expert Panel is set up to assess the acceptability of Proposed Means o Compliance (PMC) to meet ESARR provisions.

SRC DOC 5 "Consistency between ESARR 5 and ICAO SARPS – Annex 1" was developed at the time of releasing ESARR 5 to identify consistencies and differences between the respective safety provisions contained in ESARR 5 and in ICAO Annex 1. Extensive consistency is shown to exist. Where it has been necessary for ESARR 5 to differ from, or expand further upon, ICAO SARPs or to address areas not currently covered in ICAO Annex 1, the SRC DOC 5 presents the rationale in a form which may assist States in addressing these two documents at the national level.

The purpose and the scope of SRC DOC 13, Part 1 is different and does not have the intent to repeat the work carried out as mentioned above.

A number of ATM service-providers are considering the use of the EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers and its related Implementation Guidance Material as a means to show compliance with some of the provisions of ESARR 5 (see Appendix C – Backing Evidence for PMC). To be noted that ESARR 5 addresses a wider range of personnel than the PMC and as such it is recognised a priori that in order to fully comply with ESARR 5 a number of other deliverables needs to be used.

In addition the PMC needs to be used in conjunction with the EATMP "Guidelines for Common Core Content and Training Objectives for Air Traffic Controllers" and when formally recognised by SRC with "Requirements for European Class 3 Medical Certification of Air Traffic Controllers". All the above is required in order to achieve the desired compliance as it will be described later within this document.

To be noted that the usage of the Common Core Content or equivalent at least for initial training is a requirement in ESARR 5, while for the "Requirements for European Class 3 Medical Certification of Air Traffic Controllers" Expert SRC Panel has not yet expressed any recognition.

As of the publication date of SRC DOC 13, Edition 1.0, the EATMP deliverable "Requirements for European Class 3 Medical Certification of Air Traffic Controllers" was still under HRT consultation.

ESARR 5 has already recognised:

- The EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers when implemented in association with the application of EATMP Common Core Content to be valuable reference documents in implementing ESARR 5 (see ESARR 5 section 8.3. Guidance Material).

- For other ATM personnel, the EATMP Safety Policy (SAF.ET1.ST01.1000-POL-01-00), with particular reference to the Competency element in the Safety Achievement Principle, when implemented in association with the application of the ECAC Common Core Content training objectives, is considered to be valuable reference documentation for the implementation of ESARR 5

In accordance with those provisions, the scope of the assessment has considered the EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers and its Implementation Guidance Material.

This document will include the factual findings of the assessment of the EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers and its related Implementation Guidance Material against ESARR 5 requirements in the form of tables as well as a set of additional comparisons, conclusions and recommendations to support the final SRC decision making process.

The conclusions will refer to the compliance of the totality of ESARR 5, but also, as necessary, to compliance with only a part(s) of ESARR. The set of conclusions and recommendations will provide justifications supporting the final draft statement on the PMC "EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers and related Implementation Guidance Material".

SRC will then be in a position to recognise/accept or not the PMC as a Means to show compliance with ESARR 5.

Throughout Part 1 of this document, the EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers, Edition 10 and its related Implementation Guidance Material are referred as «The PMC».

3. ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 NON-OBLIGATORY SECTIONS

ESARR 5 includes sections which do not provide obligatory provisions[1] (those are: Section 1 - Scope, Section 2 - Rationale, Section 4 - Safety Objective, Section 8 - Additional Material except sub-section 8.2 Definitions. Their purpose is to define the context, rationale and purpose under which the requirements operate and provide guidance material and supplementary material.

Within the scope of this document, equivalent contents in the PMC have been considered against these non-obligatory sections.

3.1 ESARR 5, Section 1 – Scope

3.1.1 Analysis

According with the standardised approach to the formatting of ESARR, Section 1 (Scope) defines the intended scope of requirements, and what the requirements are about[2].

3.1.1.1 ESARR 5:

ESARR 5, Section 1, states that ESARR 5 is covering general safety requirements for **all ATM services' personnel responsible for safety related tasks** within the provision of ATM services across the ECAC area, and in particular the specific safety requirements for air traffic controllers.

---

[1]   See SRC Working Paper 10.9 'Future ESARR Developments'.

[2]   See SRC Working Paper 5.5 'Safety Regulation Commission Requirements Framework'.

3.1.1.2 PMC

The scope of the PMC concentrates on procedures for a harmonised ATS licensing scheme for use in the ECAC Member States. This stemmed out when EUROCONTROL invited States to undertake Work Packages (WPs) as set out in Chapter 4 of the EATCHIP Work Programme Document. Amongst other packages, WP6310, "Licensing of Controllers" was developed. The WP was re-titled Human Resources Executive Task 1, Special Task 08 (HUM.ET1.ST08)-Establish Standards for Personnel Licensing.

The aim of the Specialist task 08 was to establish the precise criteria which have to be met for the issue of personal ATS operator licences, its objective being "Development and continuous assessment of common standards of qualification and competence."

In addition the PMC states in its section 5.3. Purpose of the Licence – "the purpose of issuing an ATC Licence is to enable designated air traffic control licensing authorities to regulate air traffic controllers within their States. This regulation will include the issue, maintenance and, where necessary, the revocation of ATC licences. The licensing standards contained within the PMC have been developed to ensure as far as possible that the air traffic control services provided by licensed air traffic controllers are safe".

3.1.2 Conclusions

The PMC contains enough elements to conclude that its implementation concerns the competency of air traffic controllers. That category of personnel is included in the categories envisaged by ESARR 5 and the introduction of the licence is seen as a one possible way of regulation but not the exclusive one.

Therefore, no issues are raised by the assessment of the PMC against ESARR 5, Section 1 (Scope), except that is to be mentioned the scope of ESARR 5 is wider than this of PMC.

3.2   ESARR 5, Section 2 – Rationale

3.2.1 Analysis

According with the standardised approach to the formatting of ESARR, Section 2 (Scope) presents the rationale for the requirements, so that it is clearly specified why regulatory action is felt necessary for the improvement of aviation safety. The rationale is intended to mention any background information useful to understand the context within which the regulatory action takes place, such as ICAO potential actions and standards, and the safety benefit that is to be anticipated[3].

---

[3]   *See SRC Working Paper 5.5 'Safety Regulation Commission Requirements Framework'.*

3.2.1.1 ESARR 5

ESARR 5, Section 2, presents a rationale based on the fact that the competence of ATM personnel and, where applicable, their satisfaction of medical requirements, are fundamental elements of safety achievement, and therefore of safety management, in the provision of ATM services. The application of EUROCONTROL safety regulatory requirements in this area aims to establish harmonised minimum levels of competency and proficiency for staff having specific ATM safety responsibilities.

The same section 2 – Rationale in ESARR 5 clarifies what is understood in ESARR by the term competence (possession of the required level of knowledge, skills, experience and where required, proficiency in English, to permit the safe and efficient provision of ATM services).

3.2.1.2 PMC

The PMC states in section 5.1 Introduction - the rationale behind the development of the European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers. Mainly the PMC has been developed to enable the licence qualifications to more closely match the air traffic services being provided and to permit the recognition of additional ATC skills associated with the evolution of air traffic control systems and their related controlling procedures. The international standards are laid down in the ICAO Annex 1, Personnel Licensing and although Annex 1 has been amended during this period, the basic licensing procedures, including the ratings, have remained unchanged.

3.2.2 Conclusions

The PMC contains enough elements to conclude that EASRR 5 and PMC have common roots for their rationale.

Therefore, no issues are raised by the assessment of the PMC against ESARR 5, Section 2 (Rationale).However, the same remark stands as for the previous section: The ESARR 5 covers rationale for competency and proficiency addressing generic ATM staff undertaking safety related tasks, while the PMC is focusing on licensing as a mean to demonstrate the Air Traffic Controller Competency.

3.3 ESARR 5, Section 4 – Safety Objective

3.3.1 Analysis

According with the standardised approach to the formatting of ESARR, Section 4 (Safety Objective) is intended to present a clear and succinct statement of the safety objective to be achieved[4].

3.3.1.1 ESARR 5

ESARR 5, Section 4, states that the overall objective is aiming to ensure the competency and, where applicable, the satisfaction of medical requirements, of ATM services' personnel responsible for safety related tasks within the provision of ATM services.

---

[4]   See SRC Working Paper 5.5 'Safety Regulation Commission Requirements Framework'.

3.3.1.2 PMC

The PMC has no section where overall safety objective can be identified. However in Section One of the Guidance on Implementation of the European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers indicates that, EATMP (former EATCHIP) Domain Executive View Description, DEV4 Licensing, defines the objective of the project as "Development of harmonised legal and institutional procedures for the issue of controller certification in the form of licences and specifications of common criteria and documentation to promote consistency in the quality of service and safety throughout a harmonised ATM system".

3.3.2 Conclusions

The overall strategic objectives established at the highest level for the ECAC region can be assumed as the common objective for ESARR 5 and the PMC.

Therefore, no issues are raised by the assessment of the PMC against ESARR 5, Section 4 (Safety Objective). However, the same remark stands as for the previous sections: The ESARR 5 covers an overall safety objective for competency and proficiency addressing generic ATM staff undertaking safety related tasks, while the PMC is focusing on licensing as a mean to demonstrate the Air Traffic Controller Competency and to promote consistency in the quality of service and safety throughout a harmonised ATM system.

3.4 ESARR 5, Section 8 – Additional Material (Except Section 8.2 – Definitions)

3.4.1 Analysis

According with the standardised approach to the formatting of ESARR, Section 8 (Additional Material) is intended to include guidance information and other supplementary material.

3.4.1.1 ESARR 5

As referred in Section 8.2, Appendix A to ESARR 5 includes the definitions for specific terms used in the Requirement. Due to the fact that those definitions provide agreed terminology for the interpretation of ESARR 5 – Appendix A, it is considered mandatory when used for interpretation purposes.

Section 8.3 refers to the PMC as follows:

c) For air traffic controllers, the European Manual of Personnel Licensing - Air Traffic Controllers (HUM.ET1.ST08), when implemented in association with the application of the EATMP Common Core Content training objectives, is considered to be valuable reference documentation for the implementation of ESARR 5.

d) For other ATM personnel, the EATMP Safety Policy (SAF.ET1.ST01.1000-POL-01-00), with particular reference to the Competency element in the Safety Achievement Principle, when implemented in association with the application of the ECAC Common Core Content training objectives, is considered to be valuable reference documentation for the implementation of ESARR 5.

3.4.1.2 PMC

In addition to the development of common licensing standards, the EATMP requires the development of guidelines for the training of ATS staff in ECAC member States. As part of this programme EUROCONTROL staff, assisted by representatives from a number of ECAC member States, developed Common Core Content training syllabi for all the ATC licence rating disciplines.

The PMC indicates that compliance with the licensing requirements in conjunction with meeting the ECAC guidelines on Common Core Content should bring identifiable benefits to both the service providers and airspace users. The provision of a standard minimum level of training and the introduction of phased unit training is aimed at improving the level of expertise of air traffic controllers and consequently the standard of air traffic service provided. Requirements for ongoing competence, refresher and emergency training should also contribute to developing and maintaining controllers' skills and improve the air traffic services provided.

3.4.2 Conclusion

The analysis of Section 8 in comparison to the PMC does not raise any issue.

4. ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 SAFETY REQUIREMENTS

According with the standardised approach to the formatting of ESARR, Section 5 Safety Requirement gives a statement of precise actions which are considered necessary to achieve the stated safety objective. This section includes all applicable mandatory requirements (expressed using the word "shall"), including those relating to implementation.

Due to the nature of Section 5, the assessment against its content provides the main basis for making a judgement about the acceptability of the PMC.

This assessment is based on a complete mapping between each and every safety requirement included in ESARR 5, Section 5, and the elements of the Proposed Means of Compliance « EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers and related Implementation Guidance Material » which are considered as meeting the intent of the requirement.

4.1 Mapping of Safety Requirements

Table 1 is intended to provide a summary of results and. It identifies those mandatory provisions (as included in Section 5) not being covered by the PMC.

Tables 2 to 5 provide detailed information resulting from the comparison between ESARR 5, Section 5 and the PMC. In all cases, the literal text of ESARR 5 and PMC has been presented as far as practicable.

Tables 2 to 5 use a colour code to indicate the points where issues are raised (10% grey) In addition for the purpose of this working draft edition text in red italics has been added to cover areas of potential issue on the Comment column or to back-up the previous mapping when it is any other column except the comment one.

TABLE 1 – SUMMARY OF RESULTS			
ESARR 5 Section 5	Covered by EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers	Covered by the related Implementation Guidance Material	Not covered and comments
GENERAL REQUIREMENTS			
5.1.1	Covers only requirements for Air Traffic Controllers		- The PMC does not identify and separate requirements for Designated Authority, Service Provider and Individuals - Until SRC formal assessment of new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirement applies
5.1.2	Covers only requirements for Air Traffic Controllers		- The PMC does not identify and separate requirements for Designated Authority, Service Provider and Individuals - Until SRC formal assessment of new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirement applies
5.1.3	Covers only requirements for Air Traffic Controllers		- The PMC does not identify and separate requirements for Designated Authority, Service Provider and Individuals - Until SRC formal assessment of new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirement applies
REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE DESIGNATED AUTHORITY			
5.2.1.1	Covered		The PMC covers only Licences and does not cover Certificate of Competence
5.2.1.2	Covered		
5.2.1.3	Covered		The PMC has a slightly different definition for On-The-Job Training (introduces the notion of coach)
5.2.1.4	Covered		

ESARR 5 Section 5	Covered by EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers	Covered by the related Implementation Guidance Material	Not covered and comments
5.2.1.5	Covered	Section 3 of Guidance Material gives the users the mechanism to convert existing licence/certificate or State ATC qualifications to the European licence format	
5.2.1.6	Covered For para. d) see comments		Until SRC formal assessment of new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirement applies.
5.2.1.7	Covered For para. b) see comments		Until SRC formal assessment of new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirement applies.
5.2.1.8	Covered		Additional recognition as adequate OJTI courses goes for: - HUM.ET1.ST05.4000-GUI-01 - HRS/TSP-004-GUI-01
5.2.1.9	Covered		
5.2.1.10	Covered	The generic example of the Unit Training Plan can be used as an appropriate example and guidance to develop local unit training plans.	
5.2.1.11	Covered		
5.2.1.12	Covered		
5.2.1.13	Covered		
5.2.1.14	Covered but not applicable – see comments		Until SRC formal assessment of new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirement applies.
5.2.1.15	Covered		

ESARR 5 Section 5	Covered by EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers	Covered by the related Implementation Guidance Material	Not covered and comments
5.2.1.16	Partially covered		The licence holder is responsible for determining medical fitness to work. However according with ESARR 5 providers are required by Designated Authority to have procedures to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances. -partial coverage in PMC
5.2.1.17	Covered, but the application can divert from ESARR 5 principles		Text from 11.2 may not be applicable European wide. Only the Designated Authority on sufficient grounds can revoke, suspend and vary any licence or certificate of competence. Interpretation is correct in 11.1 and 11.3 in PMC but the guidance in 11.2 diverts from the ESARR principle.
REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE PROVIDER OF AIR TRAFFIC SERVICES			
5.2.2.1	Partially covered		Providers are not specifically required to ensure controller holds valid ratings and endorsements for the services being provided as well as valid medical certificates. Controllers are responsible for ensuring that they hold a current medical certificate.
5.2.2.2	Partially covered		Same rationale as in 5.2.2.1
5.2.2.3	Partially covered		PMC does not require the unit training plan to be approved by Designated Authority
5.2.2.4	Covered		
5.2.2.5	Partially covered		Providers are not specifically responsible for ensuring On The Job Training Instructors are appropriately qualified or hold current medical certificates. –
5.2.2.6	Covered		
5.2.2.7	Covered		
5.2.2.8	Covered		

ESARR 5 Section 5	Covered by EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers	Covered by the related Implementation Guidance Material	Not covered and comments
5.2.2.9	Para. d) not covered		According to PMC Units are not required to advice Designated Authority when an OJTI is no longer competent
5.2.2.10	Covered		
5.2.2.11	Not covered		According to PMC – Units are not specifically required to notify the Designated Authority when an Air Traffic Controller fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing competence.
5.2.2.12	Covered		
5.2.2.13	Covered		
REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS **REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE INDIVIDUAL PERSONNEL**			
5.2.3.1	Para. e) Not covered – See comments		Licence holders are not required according to PMC, to inform unit management about their medical unfitness
5.2.3.2	Para. d) Not covered – See comments		Student Licence holders are not required according to PMC, to inform unit management about their medical unfitness

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

TABLE 2 - (1/3) – ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 GENERAL REQUIREMENTS			
ESARR 5 Section 5	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.1 General Requirement	**5.** Concept and structure of European Air Traffic Controller Licence		*General Comment* *The PMC does not identify and separate requirements for Designated Authority, Service Provider and Individuals in the general part .* *The PMC covers only Air Traffic Controllers.*
5.1.1 Requires the designated authority: To ensure through regulation that persons involved in safety related tasks in the provision or support of air traffic services are competent. To support ATM service providers in identifying safety related tasks.	**5.3** describes the purpose of the licence (to enable designated air traffic control Licensing Authorities to regulate air traffic controllers within their State) and states that compliance with the standards will enable States to ensure as far as possible that the air traffic control services pro3vided by licensed air traffic controllers are safe. **2.2.** The scope of the manual concentrates on procedures for a harmonised ATS licensing scheme for use in the ECAC Member States. The manual will be capable of incorporating other specialist ATM-related licensing requirements if the ECAC ministers require them at a later date	*5. Development of a Harmonised ATC Licence* *5.3. The European Manual of Personnel Licensing - Air Traffic Controllers, which is the outcome of the project, provides a comprehensive system for the licensing and regulation of air traffic controllers.*	*The Manual does not place formal general responsibilities on the Designated Authority; it only replaces specific responsibilities.* *The Manual identifies safety regulation related tasks.* *The Manual requires a licence to allow regulation while ESARR 5 not.* *The term Designated Authority in ESARR 5 includes the ICAO Licensing Authority used in Annex 1 and in the PMC. But is not restricted to that.* *The PMC covers only Air Traffic Controllers.*

TABLE 2 - (2/3) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 GENERAL REQUIREMENTS			
ESARR 5 Section 5	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.1.2 ATM service providers are responsible for ensuring that: Persons involved in safety related tasks in the provision or support of the provision of air traffic services are competent Personnel meet the applicable medical requirements.	**9.** Air Traffic Control Safety Regulation Procedures - Competence **9.1.** **9.2.** **9.3.** Section 9 sets indications on how the experience and competency is acquired and maintained **12.** Safety Regulation Procedures Medical		*The PMC covers only ATCOs* *The Manual does not place formal general responsibilities on service providers; it only replaces specific responsibilities.* *Providers are not specifically required to ensure controller holds valid ratings and endorsements for the services being provided.* *Controllers are responsible for ensuring that they hold a current medical certificate* *The European Class 3 Medical Requirements deliverable it is not yet released and it is not yet formally assessed by the SRC AMC panel.* *Until SRC formal assessment of the new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirements are applicable.*

TABLE 2 - (3/3) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 GENERAL REQUIREMENTS			
ESARR 5 Section 5	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.1.3 A person responsible for safety related tasks in the provision or support of the provision of air traffic services shall: a) not carry out tasks unless authorised and competent to do so; b) be subject to or initiate measures to ensure ongoing competence; c) meet any medical requirements appropriate to the task.	**7.** Licensing of air traffic controllers **7.1.1.** Requires a person not to provide an air traffic control service unless he holds an ATC licence and valid rating. **9..** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures **9.1.1** Requirement that before a rating is issued competence must be demonstrated. 9.2. Maintenance of Competence **10.** Maintaining a licence **10.1.1.** Requirement for a licensed air traffic controller to remain competent and hold a current medical certificate of the appropriate category.		*The PMC covers only ATCOs.* *Requirements in chapter 7 of PMC are in the responsibility of the Licensing Authority* *The valid rating is an authorisation and requires the controller to be competent.* *The PMC does not place responsibilities for individual ATCOs to initiate measures to maintain their competence.* *The European Class 3 Medical Requirements deliverable it is not yet released and it is not yet formally assessed by the SRC AMC panel.* *Until SRC formal assessment of the new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirements are applicable.*

TABLE 3 - (1/8) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE DESIGNATED AUTHORITY			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.1.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.1.1. Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers. Designated Authority to Issue ATC licences or certificates of competence to air traffic control personnel.	**6.1.1** Other than State exempt personnel, air traffic controllers shall be required to hold a valid air traffic controller licence. 5.3 Purpose of the licence 5.17 State Regulatory Responsibility 5.9 and 6.1.1. can be used as backing argument		*The Manual does not refer to certificates of competence.*
5.2.1.2 Issue of student air traffic controller licences to persons who do not hold an air traffic controller licence.	**6.1.1** Persons not holding an air traffic controller licence must hold a student air traffic controller licence to provide an air traffic control service under supervision. + 6.1.1. as backing argument		
5.2.1.3 The issue of On-the-Job-Training Instructor licence endorsements to suitably qualified air traffic controllers.	**7.4** On the Job Training Instructor licence endorsement. **7.4.1** Requirements for the issue of on the job training instructor licence endorsements.		*The PMC introduces the notion of "coach" within the definition of On-The-Job Training..*
5.2.1.4 Approve personnel to conduct examinations and assessments.	**8.4.6** Approval of regulatory personnel. **8.4.6.1** Approval of personnel to carry out examinations and assessments.		

TABLE 3 - (2/8) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE DESIGNATED AUTHORITY			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.1.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.1.5 Air traffic controller licence to contain one or more of the ratings in the classes notified below • Aerodrome control visual • Aerodrome control instrument • Approach control procedural • Approach control surveillance • Area control procedural • Area control surveillance NOTE: *to be valid, a rating shall be associated with one or more endorsements detailing the air traffic control unit and, where applicable, the operational positions or sectors on which the air traffic controller is competent to provide an air traffic control service, and/or the specific types of services the holder of the air traffic controller licence may provide, including any type of surveillance equipment.*	**6.5** Ratings and endorsements **6.5.1** Requirement for the ATC licence to contain one or more ratings of the classes notified below: • Aerodrome control visual • Aerodrome control instrument • Approach control procedural • Approach control surveillance • Area control procedural • Area control surveillance **6.** Air Traffic Control ratings and Endorsements	*Section 3 Converting existing licence/certificate or State ATC Qualifications to the European licence format* *The ratings and rating endorsements developed for the harmonised European ATC licence can be directly substituted for the air traffic control licence ratings contained within ICAO Annex 1, Personnel Licensing. Although the names of the ratings have changed they still relate to the provision of Aerodrome Control, Approach Control and Area Control.* *Section 3 Converting existing licence/certificate or State ATC Qualifications to the European licence format*	

TABLE 3 - (3/8) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE DESIGNATED AUTHORITY			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.1.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.1.6 Before granting an air traffic controller licence and associated ratings and endorsements, ensure the applicant has: a) undertaken the appropriate initial training and has passed any associated examinations or assessments; b) successfully completed the elements of the unit training plan appropriate to the rating discipline being undertaken; c) been assessed as competent; d) holds a valid medical certificate of the appropriate class.	**7.2** Student air traffic controller **7.2.1** The issue of a student air traffic controller licence on completion of approved course and having passed associated examinations or assessments. **8.** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - training. **8.2** Regulation of training. Requirements for student and air traffic controller training. **8.3** Initial training requirements for student and/or trainee air traffic controllers. **8.4** Training at ATC units. **8.4.1** Unit training plan **8.4.1.1** Requirement for all units to have unit training plans. **8.4.3.1** Requirement for transitional training. **8.4.4.1** Requirement for pre-on the job training. **8.4.5** On the job training *cont…*	*Annex 1 – Generic Unit Training Plan* *The purpose of a Unit Training Plan is to provide structured objective based training so that a controller may achieve and maintain Validation standard. It should develop the generic training provided by an initial training centre (Institute or college) into the specific requirements of an individual unit* *The Generic example from the guidance material can be used as an appropriate example and guidance to develop local unit training plans.*	*Not specifically stated, but required through diverse references* *The European Class 3 Medical Requirements deliverable it is not yet released and it is not yet formally assessed by the SRC AMC panel.* *Until SRC formal assessment of the new medical standards will be accomplished , the ICAO Class 3 medical requirements are applicable.*

TABLE 3 - (3/8) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE DESIGNATED AUTHORITY			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.1.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
	9.1 Rating competence **9.1.1** Before a rating is issued, competence in that rating must be demonstrated. **12** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - medical. **12.2.1** Requirement for ATCOs to hold a valid medical certificate of the appropriate category.		

TABLE 3 - (4/8) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE DESIGNATED AUTHORITY			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.1.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.1.7 Before granting a student air traffic controller licence, ensure the applicant: a) has undertaken the appropriate initial training and passed any associated examinations or assessments. b) holds a valid medical certificate of the appropriate class.	**7.2** Student air traffic controller **7.2.1** Requirement for a student air traffic controller to have undertaken the appropriate initial training and have passed any associated examinations or assessments, and to hold a current medical certificate **12** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - medical. **12.2.1** Requirement student air traffic controllers to hold a valid medical certificate of the appropriate category.		*Ref. to item b)* *The European Class 3 Medical Requirements deliverable it is not yet released and it is not yet formally assessed by the SRC AMC panel.* *Until SRC formal assessment of the new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirements are applicable.*
5.2.1.8 Before granting an OJT Instructor licence endorsement, ensure the applicant has: a) a minimum of two years experience in the rating discipline in which he/she will instruct; b) a minimum of six months experience in the rating on the specific sector or operational position on which the instruction will be given; completed an appropriate OJT Instructor course and passed any associated assessments required	**7.4** On the job training instructor licence endorsement. **7.4.1** Requirement for an on the job training instructor to a) hold an air traffic controller licence; b) successfully complete an OJTI training course; c) hold a valid rating in which he will instruct for at least two years; have a minimum of six months experience in the sectors and operational positions in which he will instruct.	*Adequate OJTI course are considered:* • *Air Traffic Controllers Training at Operational Units* *Ref. -HUM.ET1.ST05.4000-GUI-01 Ed 2.0/99* • *Air Traffic Controllers Training at Operational Units – Refresher Course* *Ref. -HRS/TSP-004-GUI-01*	

TABLE 3 - (5/8) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE DESIGNATED AUTHORITY			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.1.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.1.9 ATC INITIAL training courses to satisfy the ECAC guidelines for common core training.	**8.** Air Traffic control safety regulation procedures - training. **8.3** Initial training. **8.3.1** Requires initial training to at least satisfy ECAC guidelines on common core content training.		
5.2.1.10 Requires operational ATC units to have unit training plans	**8.** Air Traffic control safety regulation procedures - training **8.4** Training at ATC units **8.4.1.1** Requirement for units to have unit training plan.	*Annex 1 – Generic Unit Training Plan* *The purpose of a Unit Training Plan is to provide structured objective based training so that a controller may achieve and maintain Validation standard. It should develop the generic training provided by an initial training centre (Institute or college) into the specific requirements of an individual unit* *The Generic example from the guidance material can be used as an appropriate example and guidance to develop local unit training plans.*	

TABLE 3 - (6/8) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE DESIGNATED AUTHORITY			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.1.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.1.11 Operational ATC units to have approved competence procedures including operational experience and competence checking system to monitor and regularly test the ongoing competence of air traffic controllers. The documented scheme shall indicate a) the process by which controllers are assessed; b) operational objectives to be met; c) personnel responsible for conducting the scheme; d) the formal mechanism for notifying the outcome of competence assessments; e) controller competence records.	**9.** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures – competence **10.** Maintaining a licence **10.1.1** Requirement for ATC units to have procedures to ensure that controllers satisfy the unit requirements for maintenance of operational competence. **9.2.2** Guidance The scheme shall be fully documented, indicating; a) the process by which controllers are assessed; b) operational objectives to be met; c) personnel responsible for conducting the scheme; d) the formal mechanism for notifying the outcome of competence assessments; e) controller competence records.		*Although identified in Guidance sections it is considered a direct mapping.* *All the content of the Manual is Guidance and not mandatory requirements (ESARR 5 is mandatory). However an AMC when used to meet ESARR requirements, then guidance becomes mandatory.*
5.2.1.12 Audit of competence procedures.	**9.2.2.Guidance**. Competent Authorities to audit competence scheme.		*The same observation as above*
5.2.1.13 Assessment for pre-entry training following a period of not exercising the rating privileges	**10.2** Non exercised rating. **10.2.1** Requirement for the licensing authority to determine a period of time following which a controller must not exercise the privileges of a rating unless assessed for pre-entry training.		

TABLE 3 - (7/8) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE DESIGNATED AUTHORITY			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.1.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.1.14 Requirement for air traffic controllers and student air traffic controllers to hold a valid medical certificate	**12** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - medical. **12.2.1** Requirement for student and air traffic controller licence holders to have a valid medical certificate of the appropriate category.		*The European Class 3 Medical Requirements deliverable it is not yet released and it is not yet formally assessed by the SRC AMC panel.* *Until SRC formal assessment of the new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirements are applicable*
5.2.1.15 Requires providers to have procedures to monitor controllers for psychoactive substance abuse and to advise controllers on taking medicines.	**12.4.1** Requires unit management to have a process for monitoring controllers for psychoactive substance abuse. *The designated Aeromed. Authority shall issue advice and information on taking of medicines.*		
5.2.1.16 Providers to have procedures to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances.	**12.3** Injury, illness and pregnancy **12.3.1** The medical certificate of the licence holder who suffers personal injury or illness involving incapacity will be deemed to be suspended. A woman who has reason to believe she is pregnant shall inform the designated Aeromedical authority. **12.4.1** Unit management will withdraw from duty a controller suspected of being under the influence of psychoactive substances.		*-The licence holder is responsible for determining medical fitness to work. However according with ESARR 5 providers are required by DA to have procedures to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances.* *-partial coverage in PMC*

TABLE 3 - (8/8) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE DESIGNATED AUTHORITY			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.1.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.1.17 Providers of air traffic services to have procedures following any case or occurrence to withdraw a controller from duty where his/her competence is in doubt. Designated Authority to revoke, suspend or vary an ATC licence.	**11.** Suspension and revocation of air traffic controller licences. **11.1.1** Requirement for an air traffic controller whose competence is in doubt to be withdrawn from duty. **11.3.1** Requirement for licensing authority to suspend air traffic controller licence/rating/endorsements. **11.4.1** Requirement for licensing authority to revoke an ATC licence, ratings, endorsements. **11.2.** To give units the Authority to prevent a controller, whose competence is in doubt, from providing an unsupervised ATC service they will be permitted to provisionally suspend the air traffic controller licence and/or associated rating(s) and/or endorsement(s). Provisional suspension is applied in the interests of safety and without prejudice; it does not indicate that a controller is not competent or that a controller was the cause of an incident or accident.		Text from 11.2 may not be applicable European wide. Only the Designated Authority on sufficient grounds can revoke, suspend and vary any licence or certificate of competence. Interpretation is correct in 11.1 and 11.3 in PMC but the guidance in 11.2 diverts from the ESARR principle. "11.2 To give units the Authority to prevent a controller, whose competence is in doubt, from providing an unsupervised ATC service they will be permitted to provisionally suspend the air traffic controller licence and/or associated ratings, and/or associated endorsements." ATC Units can only withdraw air traffic controllers from their assignments on operational positions, while only the Designated Authority can suspend the licences/ratings/endorsements.

TABLE 4 - (1/5) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE PROVIDER OF AIR TRAFFIC SERVICES			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.2.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.2.1 Providers shall ensure that an air traffic controller providing an air traffic control service a) holds valid ratings and endorsements appropriate to the service being provided; b) holds a valid medical certificate of the appropriate class; c) is competent to provide the ATC services notified in his/her ATC licence or certificate of competence.	**10.** Maintaining a licence. **10.1.1** Units to have procedures to ensure controllers satisfy the unit requirements relating to competence.		*Providers are not specifically required to ensure controller holds valid ratings and endorsements for the services being provided as well as valid medical certificates.* *Controllers are responsible for ensuring that they hold a current medical certificate.* *Partial non-compliance.*
5.2.2.2 Provider is responsible for ensuring that a student air traffic controller: a) holds a current student air traffic controller licence authorising him/her to provide the ATC service in which he/she is undertaking OJT. b) holds a valid medical certificate of the appropriate class.			*Providers are not specifically responsible for ensuring student air traffic controllers are appropriately qualified or hold current medical certificates.* *Partial non-compliance.*
5.2.2.3 Units must have unit training plans approved by the Designated Authority.	**8.** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - training **8.4** Training at ATC units **8.4.1.1** Requirement that every unit must have a unit training plan.		*The PMC does not require unit training plan to be approved by Designated Authority.* *Partial non-compliance.*

TABLE 4 - (2/5) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE PROVIDER OF AIR TRAFFIC SERVICES			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.2.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.2.4 Transitional training and pre-OJT must adequately prepare student/trainee air traffic controllers for OJT.	**8.** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - training **8.4** Training at ATC units **8.4.3.1** Requires transitional training to adequately prepare student/trainee air traffic controllers for pre-OJT. **8.4.4.1** Requirement for pre-OJT adequately to prepare student/trainee air traffic controllers for OJT.		*Additional arguments in sections 8.4.3, 8.4.4 and 8.4.5.* *(8.4.3. – Transitional training* *8.4.4. – Pre-On-The-Job training* *8.4.5. – On-The-job Training)*
5.2.2.5 Before being permitted to provide OJTI an OJT instructor shall: a) hold the appropriate valid ratings appropriate to the ATC service being instructed/trained; b) hold a valid OJT Instructor licence endorsement; c) be competent to provide the ATC services in which training is given; d) hold a valid medical certificate of the appropriate class.	**7.4** On the job training instructor licence endorsement **7.4.1** Requirement to hold a valid rating on the sector or operational positions on which he will instruct. **8.** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - training. **8.4.5.1** Requirement for on the job training instructors to hold an OJTI licence endorsement and valid rating on the sector or operational position on which they will instruct. **7.** Licensing of air traffic controllers **7.1** A person shall not provide an air traffic control service unless he holds and ATC licence with a valid rating and a current medical certificate of the appropriate category		*Providers are not specifically responsible for ensuring that On The Job Training Instructors are appropriately qualified or hold current medical certificates. – Partial compliance with ESARR 5* *Before a rating is issued, competence in that rating must be demonstrated and to continue to provide the ATC services associated with that rating, a controller must remain competent. See 9.1.1 and 10.1.1*

TABLE 4 - (3/5) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE PROVIDER OF AIR TRAFFIC SERVICES			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.2.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.2.6 Units must have approved competence schemes to satisfy the requirement that controllers must maintain operational competence and experience. These procedures shall include requirements for controllers to: a) complete a specified number of controlling hours for a specified period on the sectors or operational positions for which they hold valid ratings; b) be subject to an assessment for their continuing competence; c) undertake periodical refresher and emergency training; ensure operational competence after returning from extended periods of absence.	**9.** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - competence **9.1.1** Requirement for units to have training procedures including emergency training. **9.2.1** Requirement for units to have procedures including refresher training to ensure that controllers remain competent. **9.3.1** Requirement for controllers to carry out a minimum amount of controlling time on each sector or operational position for which their ratings are valid. **10.** Maintaining a licence **10.1.1** Requirement for ATC units to have procedures to ensure that controllers returning from extended periods of absence to satisfy unit procedures for maintaining competence.		
5.2.2.7 Units must have procedures for monitoring controllers for psychoactive substance abuse and providing advice on taking medicines.	**12.4** Psychoactive substances **12.4.1** Requirement for unit management to have processes for monitoring controllers for psychoactive substance abuse.		*The Designated Aeromedical Authority is responsible for providing advice to air traffic controllers on taking medicines.* *The arguments in 1.2.4 and 12.4.1 were used to cover the requirements for DA as well for Service Provider.*

TABLE 4 - (4/5) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE PROVIDER OF AIR TRAFFIC SERVICES			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.2.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.2.8 Units must have procedures to prevent the holder exercising the privileges of his/her licence or certificate of competence when unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances.	**10** Maintaining a licence **10.1.1** Requirement for controller who is assessed as medically unfit to be withdrawn from operational duty. **12.** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - medical **12.4.1** Requirement for a controller suspected of being under the influence of psychoactive substances to be withdrawn from ops duty.		*Responsibilities not specifically allocated to the unit management.* *Responsibilities not clearly allocated in PMC for the controller withdrawn.*
5.2.2.9 Designated authority to be notified when a) an air traffic controller's competence is in doubt or b) an air traffic controller is judged to be no longer competent c) an air traffic controller/student air traffic controller has been assessed as medically unfit d) an OJTI instructor is judged to be no longer competent to provide operational training	**11** Suspension and revocation of air traffic controller licences **11.2.1** Requirement for the unit to notify the licensing authority when it provisionally suspends an ATC licence **10.** Maintaining a licence **10.1.1** Requirement for the State licensing authority to be advised when the controller is considered to be no longer competent. **10.1.1** Requirement for the State licensing authority to be advised when a controller is no longer medically fit. **7.** Licensing of air traffic controllers **7.4.2** Guidance: State licensing authority and all units should have procedures to assess the ongoing competence of OJTIs.		*According to PMC Units are not specifically required to advise the State licensing authority when an OJTI instructor is no longer competent. (Non-compliance with ESARR 5)*

TABLE 4 - (5/5) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE PROVIDER OF AIR TRAFFIC SERVICES			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.2.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.2.10 An air traffic controller whose competence is in doubt complies with any conditions imposed upon him/her by the designated authority.	**11** Suspension and revocation of air traffic controller licences **11.3.1** Requirement for a controller to meet the terms of any conditions to have suspension removed.		*The responsibility for controller to meet the conditions to have a suspension removed, is not specifically allocated to the provider.*
5.2.2.11 The unit shall deal internally with a controller who fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing experience and shall notify the designated authority without delay.	**9.** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - competence **9.3.1** Requirement for controllers to carry out a minimum amount of controlling time on each sector or operational position for which his/her ratings are valid.		*According to PMC–Units are not specifically required to notify the Designated Authority when an Air Traffic Controller fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing competence. Non-compliance with ESARR5*
5.2.2.12 The process by which competence is to be assessed is fully documented, indicating the method by which competence is to be judged	**9.** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - competence **9.1.2** Guidance Process by which competence is to be assessed should be fully documented, indicating the method by which competence is to be judged.		
5.2.2.13 Air traffic controllers are not assigned by the unit to operational positions without appropriate supervision in cases where the Designated Authority has suspended, revoked or varied an ATC licence.	**11.** Suspension and revocation of air traffic control licences **11.2.1** Requirement for an air traffic controller whose licence is provisionally suspended to only provide an air traffic control service under the supervision of an OJTI.		

TABLE 5 - (1/3) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE INDIVIDUAL PERSONNEL			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.3.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.3.1 A licensed air traffic controller shall ensure that he/she: a) holds valid ratings and endorsements appropriate to the ATC services he/she is providing; b) complies with the unit competency scheme and is competent to provide the ATC services notified in his/her ATC licence or certificate of competence; c) complies with any conditions that may be required by the designated authority when his/her competence is in doubt; d) holds a valid medical certificate of the appropriate class; e) informs the management of the unit if he/she is no longer medically fit to provide an air traffic control service;	**7.** Licensing of air traffic controllers **7.1.1** Requirement for a person not to provide an air traffic control service unless he holds an air traffic controller licence with a valid rating, including any associated endorsements, relating to the air traffic service being provided. **10.** Maintaining a licence **10.1.1** Requirement for a licensed air traffic controller not to provide an air traffic control service unless he remains competent. **11.** Suspension and revocation of air traffic controller licences. **11.3.1** Requires controllers to meet the terms of any conditions placed on the licence. **7.1.1** Requires that a person shall not provide an air traffic control service unless he holds a current medical certificate of the appropriate category.		*Licence holders are not required to inform their unit management of unfitness.* *(non-compliance with ESARR 5).*

TABLE 5 - (2/3) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE INDIVIDUAL PERSONNEL			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.3.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
5.2.3.1 continued f) does not provide an ATC service while under the influence of psychoactive substances; g) does not exercise the privileges of his licence or certificate of competence when medically unfit.	**12.** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - medical. **12.4.1** Requires that an air traffic controller shall not provide an air traffic control service whilst under the influence of psychoactive substances. **12.3.1** The medical certificate of a licence holder who suffers personal injury or illness involving incapacity will be deemed to be suspended (see 7.1.1).		*In PMC there is no clear Responsibility placed on individuals*
5.2.3.2 A student air traffic controller shall ensure that he/she: a) holds a current student air traffic controller licence or certificate of competence; b) complies with the unit competency scheme and is competent to undertake on the job training; c) holds a valid medical certificate of the appropriate class;	**7.** Licensing of air traffic controller **7.2.1** Requires that a person who does not hold an air traffic controller licence shall not provide an air traffic control service under the supervision of an OJTI unless he holds a student air traffic controller licence and a current medical certificate of the appropriate category. **12.** Air traffic control safety regulation procedures - medical.		

TABLE 5 - (3/3) - ASSESSMENT AGAINST ESARR 5 REQUIREMENTS FOR AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLERS REQUIREMENTS TO BE APPLIED BY THE INDIVIDUAL PERSONNEL			
ESARR 5 Section 5.2.3.	**EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing** Statements/Principles covering the Requirement	**Implementation Guidance Material on EATMP Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers** Sections covering the Requirement	**COMMENTS**
d) informs the unit management if he/she is medically unfit to provide an ATC service; e) does not undertake on the job training while under the influence of psychoactive substances; f) does not undertake on the job training when medically unfit.	**12.4.1** Requirement that a student air traffic controller does not provide an air traffic control service while under the influence of psychoactive substances. **12.3.1** Requirement that the validity of the medical certificate of the licence holder who suffers personal injury or illness involving incapacity will be deemed to be suspended		*The PMC does not require to inform unit management of medical unfitness (Non-compliance with ESARR 5).*

4.2   Issues

In the light of the analysis supported by the above mapping tables, the assessment against the safety requirements of ESARR 5 - Section 5 (Safety Requirements) raises the following issues:

- In relation to Section 5 Safety Requirements and particularly to section 5.1 General requirements (para 5.1.1., 5.1.2., and 5.1.3.):

  ISSUE 1 -

  The PMC does not identify and separate requirements for Designated Authority, Service Provider and Individuals.

- In relation to all section 5 Safety Requirements:

  ISSUE 2 -

  The PMC covers only Licences and does not cover Certificate of Competence.

- In relation to all ESARR 5 scope and content:

  ISSUE 3 -

  The PMC definition of Designated Authority is restricted to the ICAO State Licensing Authority definition while ESARR 5 definition for the same key term is broader and includes the State Licensing Authority.

- In relation to section 5.2.1 Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers to be applied by the Designated Authority, para. 5.2.1.3 and Appendix A – Glossary and Definitions:

  ISSUE 4 -

  The PMC has a slightly different definition for OJTI (the PMC introduces the notion of coach).

- In relation to section 5.1 General Requirements and section 5.2.1 Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers to be applied by the Designated Authority, para. 5.2.1.6 and 5.2.1.7, 5.2.1.14 and section 5.2.2. and 5.2.1. when referring to medical fitness:

  ISSUE 5 -

  The European Class 3 Medical Requirements deliverable it is not yet released and it is not yet formally assessed by the SRC AMC panel.

  Until SRC formal assessment of the new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirements are applicable.

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

- In relation to section 5.2.1 Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers to be applied by the Designated Authority - para. 5.2.1.16:

   ISSUE 6 -

   The licence holder is responsible for determining medical fitness to work. However according with ESARR 5, service providers are required by the Designated Authority to have procedures to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances. The PMC provides no specific procedures on HOW this requirement can be met.

- In relation to section 5.2.2 Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers to be applied by the Provider of Air Traffic Services - para. 5.2.2.3:

   ISSUE 7 –

   The ESARR 5 requirement on ATS Units to have unit training plans approved by the Designated Authority, it is only partially covered. The PMC does not require the unit training plan to be approved by the Designated Authority.

- In relation to section 5.2.2 Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers to be applied by the Provider of Air Traffic Services - para. 5.2.2.9:

   ISSUE 8 -

   According to PMC, ATS Units are not required to advice Designated Authority when an OJTI is no longer competent to provide On-The-Job training. ESARR 5 requires in para. 5.2.2.9 d) to ATS Units to provide this information to the Designated Authority.

- In relation to section 5.2.2 Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers to be applied by the Provider of Air Traffic Services – para. 5.2.2.11:

   ISSUE 9 -

   ESARR 5 requires in para. 5.2.2.11 to ATS Units to deal internally with a controller who fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing experience and to notify the Designated Authority without delay. According to PMC – Units are not specifically required to notify the Designated Authority when an Air Traffic Controller fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing competence.

- In relation to section 5.2.3 Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers to be applied by the Individual Personnel - para. 5.2.3.1. e) and para 5.2.3.2 d):

   ISSUE 10 -

   ESARR 5 requires to individual personnel –both licensed air traffic controllers and student air traffic controllers respectively-, to inform the management of the unit when there is any decrease in his/her medical fitness which might render the holder unable to safely and properly exercise the privileges granted by his/her licence. According to PMC the licence holders are not required to inform the unit management about their medical unfitness.

   ISSUE 11

   ESARR 5 requires stipulates that only The Designated Authority shall, on sufficient grounds being shown to its satisfaction after due inquiry, revoke, suspend or vary any licence or certificate of competence.

The PMC procedure may not be always applicable European wide. Interpretation is correct in 11.1 and 11.3 in PMC but the guidance in the section 11.2 diverts from the ESARR principle.

ATC Units can only withdraw air traffic controllers from their assignments on operational positions, while only the Designated Authority can suspend the licences/ratings/endorsements.

4.3 Analysis of Issues

4.3.1 Issue 1

4.3.1.1 Statement

The PMC does not identify and separate requirements for Designated Authority, Service Provider and Individuals.

4.3.1.2 Explanation

The overall safety objective is to ensure the competency and, where applicable, the satisfaction of medical requirements, of ATM services' personnel responsible for safety related tasks within the provision of ATM services.

The European Manual of Personnel Licensing needs to be used in conjunction with its Guidance Material on Implementation. The separation of the responsibilities amongst the three players: the Designated Authority, the provider of ATS Services and the individual personnel it is capture in the licensing project only in the second deliverable (Guidance Material on Implementation) which has to be considered as an integrated part of PMC.

4.3.1.3 Conclusion

This issue does not prevent the acceptability of the PMC if the clarification of roles is followed according with ESARR 5. Additional benefit is gained if Guidance Material on Implementation (ref. HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2001)- is used in conjunction with the European Manual of Personnel Licensing (ref. - HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01, Edition 1.0, 8 September 2000).

4.3.2 Issue 2

4.3.2.1 Statement

The PMC covers only Licences and does not cover Certificate of Competence.

4.3.2.2 Explanation

Section 3 - Applicability of ESARR 5 requires as follows:

The general requirements shall apply to designated authorities, to providers of air traffic services and to all ATM services' personnel responsible for tasks which, within the provision of an ATM service, are identified as safety related.

The specific requirements for air traffic controllers shall apply to:

■ civil designated authorities, civil service providers and civil personnel providing air traffic services to military and civil air traffic;

■ military authorities and their personnel providing air traffic services to civil and military air traffic in a mixed civil-military environment, except where an equivalent military licensing scheme exists.

Equivalent national regulations shall apply to military authorities and their personnel providing air traffic services to military air traffic in a segregated military airspace environment.

It is obviously that PMC covers and it is proposed to cover only the specific requirements for Air Traffic Controllers.

4.3.2.3 Conclusion

This issue does not prevent the acceptability of the PMC in regard of specific requirements for Air Traffic Controllers. The PMC is not to be used for other categories of ATM personnel undertaking safety related tasks.

4.3.3   Issue 3

4.3.3.1 Statement

The PMC definition of Designated Authority is restricted to the ICAO State Licensing Authority definition while ESARR 5 definition for the same key term is broader and includes the State Licensing Authority.

4.3.3.3 Explanation

The Designated Authority definition approved by SRC is referring to the competent body designated by State authority, responsible for aviation safety regulation

In terms of ESARR 5 it is understood that the Designated Authority definition encompasses the responsibilities of the currently Licensing Authority defined in ICAO Annex 1.

4.3.3.3 Conclusion

This issue does not prevent the acceptability of the PMC when during the implementation the designated authority responsibilities will be ensured by the State Licensing Authority.

4.3.4   Issue 4

4.3.4.1 Statement

The PMC has a slightly different definition for On-The-Job Training (the PMC introduces the notion of coach).

4.3.4.2 Explanation

ESARR 5 defines the On-the-Job Training as - the integration in practice of previously acquired job related routines and skills under the supervision of a qualified On-the-Job instructor in a live traffic situation.

According to PMC definition of On-The-Job Training, a new notion is introduced to replace the OJTI and that is the "coach" rating. However everywhere else in the PMC documentation only the OJTI licence endorsement it is used.

4.3.4.3 Conclusion

This issue does not prevent the acceptability of the PMC if the OJTI licence endorsement is used instead of the jargon "coach" endorsement.

4.3.5   Issue 5

4.3.5.1 Statement

The European Class 3 Medical Requirements deliverable it is not yet released and it is not yet formally assessed by the SRC AMC panel.

4.3.5.2 Explanation

The holders of air traffic controller licences and student air traffic controller licences are required to have a minimum standard of medical fitness to ensure they are fit to provide an ATC service and to minimise, as far as possible, the risk that they will become suddenly incapacitated to an extent that the safety of aircraft could be compromised.

The designated Aeromedical Authority will be required to apply the minimum medical standards. At the date of issuing this document the 'Requirements for European Class 3 Medical Certification of Air Traffic Controllers' (EATMP, 2000b) for initial and renewal medical examinations for the issue of medical certificates associated with the Harmonised European ATC licence are not yet approved and not formally assessed by SRC as acceptable means of compliance.

Until SRC formal assessment of the new medical standards will be accomplished, the ICAO Class 3 medical requirements are applicable.

4.3.5.3 Conclusion

The PMC can be considered acceptable until further notice to cover the medical fitness requirements in ESARR 5., only if used in conjunction with ICAO Class 3 medical requirements described in ICAO Annex 1.

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

4.3.6 Issue 6

4.3.6.1 Statement

The licence holder is responsible for determining medical fitness to work. However according with ESARR 5, service providers are required by the Designated Authority to have procedures to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances. The PMC provides no specific procedures on HOW this requirement can be met.

4.3.6.2 Explanation

ESARR 5 demands only WHAT and not HOW the medical fitness shall be established.

4.3.6.3 Conclusion

The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the medical fitness requirements in ESARR 5, only if supplemented with detailed procedures at unit level to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances.

4.3.7 Issue 7

4.3.7.1 Statement

The ESARR 5 requirement on ATS units to have unit training plans approved by the Designated Authority, it is only partially covered. The PMC does not require the unit training plan to be approved by the Designated Authority.

4.3.7.2 Explanation

It is a safety oversight principle to have unit training plans approved by the Designated Authority and not only by the unit management and/or service provider management.

4.3.7.3 Conclusion

The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the unit training plans requirements in ESARR 5, only if the unit training plans developed according to the PMC guidelines are then submitted for approval to the Designated Authority.

4.3.8 Issue 8

4.3.8.1 Statement

According to PMC, Units are not required to advice Designated Authority when an OJTI is no longer competent to provide On-The-Job training. ESARR 5 requires in para. 5.2.2.9 d) to ATS Units to provide this information to the Designated Authority.

4.3.8.2 Explanation

It is a safety oversight principle to notify the Designated Authority when an OJTI is no longer competent to provide On-The-Job Training in order that Designated Authority, whenever is the case, on sufficient grounds being shown to its satisfaction after due inquiry, revoke, suspend or vary any licence or certificate of competence.

4.3.8.3 Conclusion

The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the OJTI requirements in ESARR 5, only if units will have established procedures with the Designated Authority to notify whenever an OJTI is no longer competent to provide On-The-Job Training.

4.3.9   Issue 9

4.3.9.1 Statement

ESARR 5 requires in para. 5.2.2.11 to ATS Units to deal internally with a controller who fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing experience and to notify the Designated Authority without delay. According to PMC – Units are not specifically required to notify the Designated Authority when an Air Traffic Controller fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing competence.

4.3.9.2 Explanation

It is a safety oversight principle to notify the Designated Authority when a controller fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing experience in order that, unless appropriate mitigation is found locally and whenever is the case, on sufficient grounds being shown to its satisfaction after due inquiry, Designated authority to be able to revoke, suspend or vary any licence or certificate of competence.

4.3.9.3 Conclusion

The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the requirements for the air traffic services units in ESARR 5, only if units will have established procedures with the Designated Authority to notify whenever an air traffic controller fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing experience.

4.3.10 Issue 10

4.3.10.1 Statement

ESARR 5 requires in para. 5.2.3.1 e) to individual personnel licensed air traffic controllers and student air traffic controllers respectively, to inform the management of the unit when there is any decrease in his/her medical fitness which might render the holder unable to safely and properly exercise the privileges granted by his/her licence. According to PMC the licence holders are not required to inform the unit management about their medical unfitness.

4.3.10.2 Explanation

It is a safety oversight principle to notify the Designated Authority when there is any decrease in a licence/certificate of competence holder medical fitness which might render the holder unable to safely and properly exercise the privileges granted by his/her licence.

4.3.10.3 Conclusion

The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the requirements for air traffic controllers to be applied by the individual personnel (both licensed/certificated air the air traffic controller and student air traffic controller) in ESARR 5, only if Designated Authority will publish additional requirements to set-up an institutional framework to allow the individuals to report whenever there is any decrease in a licence/certificate of competence holder medical fitness which might render the holder unable to safely and properly exercise the privileges granted by his/her licence.

4.3.11 Issue 11

4.3.11.1 Statement

ESARR 5 requires stipulates that only The Designated Authority shall, on sufficient grounds being shown to its satisfaction after due inquiry, revoke, suspend or vary any licence or certificate of competence.

The PMC procedure may not be always applicable European wide. Interpretation is correct in 11.1 and 11.3 in PMC but the guidance in the section 11.2 diverts from the ESARR principle.

ATC Units can only withdraw air traffic controllers from their assignments on operational positions, while only the Designated Authority can suspend the licences/ratings/endorsements.

4.3.11.2 Explanation

To vary, revoke or suspend the qualification documents, it is only in the remit of the body who has formally released them and that is the Designated Authority.

4.3.11.3 Conclusion

The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the requirements for revocation and suspension of the licence/certificate of competence and/or its associated ratings(s) and endorsement(s), with the exception of provisions for provisional suspensions, where the requirements in ESARR 5 para 5.2.1.17 needs to met by using other procedures than those mentioned in PMC.

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

5. ASSESSMENT AGAINST OTHER OBLIGATORY PROVISIONS

5.1 ESARR 5, Section 3 – Applicability

5.1.1 Analysis

According with the standardised approach to the formatting of ESARR, Section 3 (Applicability) specifies the scope of applicability of the requirements, i.e. the elements of the ATM system, as well as the categories of organisations that are subject to the requirement[5].

The general requirements in ESARR 5 shall apply to designated authorities, to providers of air traffic services and to all ATM services' personnel responsible for tasks which, within the provision of an ATM service, are identified as safety related.

The specific requirements for air traffic controllers in ESARR 5 shall apply to:

- civil designated authorities, civil service providers and civil personnel providing air traffic services to military and civil air traffic;

- military authorities and their personnel providing air traffic services to civil and military air traffic in a mixed civil-military environment, except where an equivalent military licensing scheme exists.

Equivalent national regulations shall apply to military authorities and their personnel providing air traffic services to military air traffic in a segregated military airspace environment.

There is no need for equivalent provisions due to the non-regulatory nature of the PMC. However, as already discussed[6] the PMC identifies the procedures for a harmonised ATS licensing scheme for use in the ECAC Member States. Although developed for the civil ATM community the PMC used in conjunction with the Guidelines for Common Core Content for training may be used by the military ATM community, for the implementation of ESARR 5.

5.1.2 Conclusions

No issues are raised by the assessment against Section 3 (Applicability).

5.2 ESARR 5 Section 6 - Implementation

5.2.1 Analysis

The provisions of the requirement are effective within three years from the date of adoption by the EUROCONTROL Commission. ESARR 5 was adopted by the EUROCONTROL Commission on 10.10.2000 (Decision 85/10.10.2001). Additional ECIP SRC05 objective was developed and the above mentioned target date was reiterated for all the interested stakeholders

---

[5]   See SRC Working Paper 5.5 'Safety Regulation Commission Requirements Framework'.

[6]   See Section 3.1 of this document.

The PMC contain equivalent provisions for its implementation. The target date for implementation, as shown in the original CIP was September 2003. That was reviewed and the target date is now November 2001 which makes it consistent with ESARR 5 target date. An HUM ECIP objective is currently being prepared to support the PMC implementation (ECIP HUM04).

5.2.2 Conclusions

No issues are raised by the assessment against Section 6 (Implementation)

5.3 ESARR 5, Section 7 – Exemptions

ESARR 5 allows exemptions with reference to sections 5.2.1.8 a) and 5.2.1.8 b):

> *"5.2.1.8. before granting an air traffic controller authorisation to provide operational training as an OJT Instructor, ensure that the applicant has:*
>
> *a) a minimum of two years experience in the rating discipline in which he/she will instruct;*
>
> *b) a minimum of six months experience in the rating on the specific sector or operational position on which the instruction will be given;"*

It is appreciated that there may be circumstances whereby these requirements of ESARR 5 cannot be met. These circumstances shall be evaluated by the Designated Authority, after which a documented exemption may be issued. The exemption shall ensure an equivalent level of safety.

States applying exemptions to section 5.2.1.8 and using a different approach but ensuring the same level of safety will be required to notify the equivalence.

The PMC is fully compliant with the requirement 5.2.1.8. in ESARR 5 and does not give guidance to any exemption. However the PMC mainly in its Guidance on Implementation details issues which might show up when a different approach is used.

To be noted that the PMC was elaborated on the ECAC States' Minister of Transport request to introduce a harmonised European licensing scheme. The second aim beyond safety for PMS is free movement of labour.

The details on harmonised Licensing Issues are to be found in SECTION 4 of PMC Guidance on Implementation.

5.4 ESARR 5, Section 8.2 – Definitions

5.4.1 Analysis

Definitions for specific terms used in ESARR 5 are included in Appendix A to the Requirement.

Alternative definitions can be used by various means of compliance. However, the interpretation of the Requirement should be based on the specific terminology of Appendix A to ESARR 5.

The PMC uses a slightly different for the On-The-Job Training Instructor which introduces the notion of "coach". No other major differences had to be considered throughout this assessment.

5.4.2 Conclusion

The definitions used in the EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers, are consistent with those used in ESARR 5 with the only exemption for the On-The-Job .Training Instructor.

Both definitions are aiming to the same category of personnel for which appropriate requirements have been identified, but PMC is introducing a new category ("coach") for which ESARR 5 makes no provisions.

6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 Conclusion 1

Based on the mapping of requirements presented in form of tables in Section 4, this assessment concludes that,

The acceptability of PMC in relation to section 5.1 General requirements is subject to exclusive applicability for Air traffic Controllers and not to the entire ATM Services' Personnel undertaking safety related tasks.

Additionally for the medical generic fitness only ICAO Annex 1 Medical requirements applies until further notification.

Recommendation 1:

When using PMC, the designated authority, the service provider and individual staff shall make clear application to Air Traffic Controllers and to appropriate ICAO Medical Standards as laid down in ICAO Annex 1.

6.2 Conclusion 2

Based on the mapping of requirements presented in form of tables in Section 4, this assessment concludes that,

The acceptability of PMC in relation to section 5.2. Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers sub-section 5.2.1. Requirements to be applied by the Designated Authority, is subject to the following additional issues to be refereed:

- the PMC covers only licences;

- the PMC introduces the notion of "coach";

- the PMC shall be restricted until further notice to ICAO Class 3 medical requirements;

- The PMC shall be supplemented with procedures to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances.

- The PMC shall be supplemented with procedures to meet the requirements in 5.2.1.17 referring to the temporary suspension of licence/certificate of competence

Recommendation 2:

When using PMC, the designated authority (which encompasses the definition of ICAO State Licensing Authority) should specifically clarify:

- The On-The-Job Training definition;

- The procedures to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances.

6.3 Conclusion 3

Based on the mapping of requirements presented in form of tables in Section 4, this assessment concludes that,

The acceptability of PMC in relation to section 5.2. Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers sub-section 5.2.2. Requirements to be applied by the provider of air traffic services, is subject to the following additional issues to be refereed:

- the PMC shall be restricted until further notice to ICAO Class 3 medical requirements;

- approval of unit training plans by the Designated Authority;

- publication of procedures to advice Designated Authority when on OJTI is no longer competent to provide On-The-Job Training;

- publication of procedures to notify the Designated Authority when an Air Traffic Controller fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing competence.

Recommendation 3:

When using PMC, the service provider should specifically clarify:

- Procedures for approval of unit training plans by the Designated Authority

- Procedures to advice Designated Authority when on OJTI is no longer competent to provide On-The-Job Training;

- Procedures to notify the Designated Authority when an Air Traffic Controller fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing competence.

6.3 Conclusion 4

Based on the mapping of requirements presented in form of tables in Section 4, this assessment concludes that,

The acceptability of PMC in relation to section 5.2. Requirements for Air Traffic Controllers sub-section 5.2.3. Requirements to be applied by the individual personnel, is subject to the following additional issues to be refereed:

- the PMC shall be restricted until further notice to ICAO Class 3 medical requirements;

- licence holders are required to inform unit management about their medical unfitness.

Recommendation 4:

When using PMC, the service provider and the individual staff should specifically clarify the procedures by which licence holders are required to inform unit management about their medical unfitness.

7.   STATEMENT OF COMPLIANCE (EAM 5 / AMC 1)

> **I.   The implementation of the Proposed Means of Compliance «EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing (reference -HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01, Edition 1.0, 8 September 2000) and its related Guidance Material on Implementation (reference HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2001)» meets the mandatory provisions of ESARR 5, Edition 1.0 November 2001, <u>only when supplemented</u> with the following features:**
>
> a)   The clarification of roles of the Designated Authority, the provider of air traffic services and the individual personnel is followed according with ESARR 5. Guidance Material on Implementation ref. (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2001) - needs to be used in conjunction with the European Manual of Personnel Licensing ref. (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01, Edition 1.0, 8 September 2000).
>
> b)   The PMC is not to be used for other categories of ATM personnel undertaking safety related tasks, except for Air Traffic Controllers.
>
> c)   OJTI licence endorsement is used instead of the jargon "coach" for the On-The-Job Training definition
>
> d)   Until further notice, PMC is acceptable to meet the ESARR 5 medical requirements, only if it is used in conjunction with ICAO Class 3 medical standards laid down in ICAO Annex 1 and only if supplemented with detailed procedures at unit level to prevent licence holders to exercise their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances.
>
> e)   The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the unit training plans requirements in ESARR 5, only if the unit training plans developed according to the PMC guidelines are then submitted for approval to the Designated Authority.
>
> f)   The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the OJTI requirements in ESARR 5, only if ATS units will have established procedures with the Designated Authority to notify whenever an OJTI is no longer competent to provide On-The-Job Training.
>
> g)   The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the requirements for the air traffic services units in ESARR 5, only if ATS units will have established procedures with the Designated Authority to notify whenever an air traffic controller fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing experience.
>
> h)   The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the requirements for air traffic controllers to be applied by the individual personnel (both licensed/certificated air the air traffic controller and student air traffic controller) in ESARR 5, only if Designated Authority will publish additional requirements to set-up an institutional framework to allow the individuals to report whenever there is any decrease in a licence/certificate of competence holder medical fitness which might render the holder unable to safely and properly exercise the privileges granted by his/her licence.
>
> i)   Additional procedures are required to be developed to meet the requirements in 5.2.1.17 referring to the temporary suspension of licence/certificate of competence;

II. Additionally the following EATMP courses have been recognised as adequate OJTI courses complying with ESARR 5 requirements:

- Air Traffic Controllers Training at Operational Units (Ref. - HUM.ET1.ST05.4000-GUI-01 Ed 2.0/99)

- Air Traffic Controllers Training at Operational Units – Refresher Course (Ref. -HRS/TSP-004-GUI-01)

III. The generic example of a unit training plans presented in Guidance Material on Implementation of European Manual of Personnel Licensing (ref. HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2001) is considered an acceptable example and guidance to develop local unit training plans.

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

PART 2

Assessment of the EATM 'European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers', Edition 2.0 as a Means of Compliance with ESARR 5, Edition 2.0

1. INTRODUCTION

In 2007 a new Expert Panel was organised to assess to what extent the EATM "European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01, Edition 2.0, 14 June 2004), implemented with the support of its related "Guidance on Implementation" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2001), complied with ESARR 5 "ATM Services' Personnel", Edition 2.0.

The assessment provided in Part 1 of this document generated the first Statement of Compliance – EAM 5 / AMC 1, dated 26th February 2002. Due to the issues raised within EAM 5 / AMC 1, the European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers was modified and Edition 2.0 was issued.

The template followed in Part 1 was considered unsuitable in this case due to the possibility of repeating the previous analysis. As such, the work of the Expert Panel compared the issues highlighted within EAM 5/ AMC 1, dated the 26th February 2002 against the modifications introduced by Edition 2.0 of the European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers.

Throughout Part 2 of this document, the EATMP European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers, Edition 2.0 and its related Implementation Guidance Material are referred as the 'PMC'.

2. PURPOSE AND SCOPE

EUROCONTROL DAP/SSH wrote to the SRC Chairman requesting that the PMC be assessed and recognised as an Acceptable Means of Compliance with ESARR 5, Edition 2.0.

An expert panel was created to provide an analysis of the PMC against ESARR 5 provisions. The process under which the SRC Expert Assessment Panel will work is described in SRC Document 9 'Process for Establishing Acceptable Means of Compliance (AMC) with ESARRs'.

It should be noted that ESARR 5, Edition 2.0 addresses a wider range of personnel than the PMC and as such it is recognised a priori that the scope of the analysis is limited to Air Traffic Controllers only.

SRC will then be in a position to recognise / accept or not the PMC as a Means to show compliance with ESARR 5, Edition 2.0.

3. ANALYSIS

The analysis previously carried out in 2002 when the first Statement of Compliance (EAM 5 / AMC 1) was issued remains valid. As such, the analysis will only address the issues previously identified in Part I of EAM 5 / AMC 1. Additionally, the conclusion and recommendations proposed in Part I of this document will be taken into consideration when analysing the modifications proposed in the new version of the PMC.

3.1 Issues Raised in Part I of EAM 5 / AMC 1

3.1.1 Issue a)

AMC Statement

"The clarification of roles of the Designated Authority, the provider of air traffic services and the individual personnel is followed according with ESARR 5. Guidance Material on Implementation ref. (HUM.ET1.ST08.-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2000) - needs to be used in conjunction with the European Manual of Personnel Licensing ref. (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01, Edition 1.0, 8 September 2000)."

Proposed Modifications

The EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers proposed the following modifications to address this issue:

Modification 1 - Insertion in Section 4 Definition, Abbreviations and Acronyms of the Designated Authority Definition (page 11, see text in red)

"Designated Authority

The competent body designated by State Authority, responsible for aviation safety regulation.

Reference: SRC-RTF (based on JAR 21) (see ESARR 5 [SRC, 2002b]).

Note: In terms of ESARR 5 it is understood that the Designated Authority definition encompasses the responsibilities of the currently defined Licensing Authority in ICAO Annex 1 as follows:

> *a) assessment of an applicant's qualifications to hold a licence or rating;*
> *b) issue and endorsement of licences and ratings;*
> *c) designation and authorisation of approved persons;*
> *d) approval of training courses;*
> *e) approval of the use of synthetic trainers;*
> *f) validation of licences issued by other Contracting States.*

Reference: ICAO Annex 1 (1988)."

Analysis

The definition of the Designated Authority included in the PMC is the same with the one used by ESARR 5.

Modification 2 - Insertion in Section 5.2 of new text (page 19, see text in red)

"5.2. The European Manual of Personnel Licensing - Air Traffic Controllers

This Manual contains regulatory and administrative procedures for the issue and maintenance of ATC licences within ECAC States. It has been produced to enable Designated Authorities to licence air traffic controllers in accordance with standards and procedures that are harmonised throughout the ECAC States.

The Manual contains provisions which refer to the Designated Authority, air traffic service providers and individuals within a State. When applying the Manual at national level the Designated Authority and the air traffic service provider should be clearly identified within the framework of a State in order that actions are taken by the appropriate party responsible within the licensing system. In order to clearly apportion the responsibilities at national level the Manual shall be used in conjunction with ESARR 5.

ECAC States that are also members of ICAO and signatories to the Chicago Convention are required to comply, as far as is practicable, with the standards published in the Annexes to the Convention on International Civil Aviation. The licensing standards and procedures included in this Manual differ from ICAO Annex 1 as recorded in Annex E of this Manual."

Analysis

The new text provided for better explanation of the roles of the Designated Authority, the provider of air traffic services and the individual personnel. This is now aligned with the requirements and understanding in ESARR 5.

Modification 3 - Replace "Licensing Authority" with "Designated Authority"

Analysis

The modification proposed is an editorial one and provides for harmonised terminology across the PMC. Additionally, this is consistent with Modification 1 proposed above.

Conclusion

The PMC contains enough elements to conclude that clarification of roles of the Designated Authority, the provider of air traffic services and the individual personnel is followed according with ESARR 5. Additional benefit is gained if Guidance Material on Implementation ref. (HUM.ET1.ST08.-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2000) is used in conjunction with the European Manual of Personnel Licensing ref. (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01, Edition 1.0, 8 September 2000).

The analysis provided above in comparison to the PMC does not raise any issue.

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

3.1.2   Issue b)

AMC Statement

"The PMC is not to be used for other categories of ATM personnel undertaking safety related tasks, except for Air Traffic Controllers."

Proposed Modifications

The EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers proposed the following modification to address this issue:

Modification 1 - Insertion in Section 2.2 Scope of new text (page 5, see text in red)

"2.2 Scope

In 1993, EUROCONTROL invited States to undertake Work Packages (WPs) as set out in Chapter 4 of the EATCHIP Work Programme Document (EATCHIP, 1996a). Amongst other packages, the UK volunteered, and was accepted, to develop WP6310, 'Licensing of Controllers'. The WP was re-titled 'Human Resources Executive Task 1 - Special Task 08 (HUM.ET1.ST08) - Establish Standards for Personnel Licensing'.

The scope of this Manual concentrates on procedures for a harmonised ATS licensing scheme for use in the ECAC Member States. The Manual will be capable of incorporating other specialist ATM-related licensing requirements if the ECAC ministers require them at a later date. However, this latter requirement does not form part of the project contracted to the UK. In its present edition the Manual can be used to demonstrate compliance only with air traffic controller requirements laid down in ESARR 5 (SRC, 2002b).

To progress the project, the Human Resources Team Licensing Work Group (HRT-LWG) was established consisting of members from The Netherlands, France, Germany, Ireland, Denmark, Switzerland, Portugal, the International Federation of Air Traffic Controllers' Associations (IFATCA), the Task Force Common Core Content (TF-CCC), EUROCONTROL and the UK Project Team. The group continued to meet through the development of the draft Licensing Manual. The Licensing Manual has been scrutinised by specialist European ATS safety regulators before submission to the HRT for endorsement.

The document 'European Manual of Personnel Licensing - Air Traffic Controllers: Guidance on Implementation' (EATMP, 2001a – L2), published in November 2001, is intended to provide advice and assistance and should be used by those responsible for implementing the ATCO licensing scheme laid out in this Licensing Manual".

Analysis

The acceptability of PMC in relation to section 5.1 General requirements is subject to exclusive applicability for Air traffic Controllers and not to all ATM Services' Personnel undertaking safety-related tasks. The new text inserted in Section 2.2 of the PMC clarifies the usage of it to air traffic controllers only.

> **Conclusion**
>
> The PMC contains sufficient elements to conclude that it can only be used to demonstrate compliance in the case of air traffic controllers against ESARR 5 requirements.
>
> The analysis provided above in comparison to the PMC does not raise any issue.

3.1.3   Issue c)

AMC Statement

"OJTI licence endorsement is used instead of the jargon "coach" for the On-The-Job Training definition."

Proposed Modifications

The EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers proposed the following modifications to address this issue:

Modification 1 - Modification in Section 4 Definition, Abbreviations and acronyms of the definition for OJT (page 5, see text in red)

"On-the-Job Training (OJT)

The integration in practice of previously acquired job-related routines and skills under the supervision of a qualified On-the-Job-Training instructor in a live traffic situation.

Reference: 'Air Traffic Controller Training at Operational Units' (EATMP, 1999 – T10)."

Modification 2 - Replace "coach" with "OJTI"

Modification 3 - Editorial correction in Annex C – Air Traffic Controller Licence format (see text in red)

The modification proposed consists of the insertion in Page 4 of the ATCO Licence format of the

"Licence Endorsement Abbreviation

On-the-job Training   OJT " (see fig.1)

Analysis

The modifications proposed are according to the recommendations made before in Part I of this document.

Figure 1


```
Licence Page 4

DECODE

Rating Abbreviations

Aerodrome Control Visual          ADV
Aerodrome Control Instrument      ADI
Approach Control Procedural       APP
Approach Control Surveillance     APS
Area Control Procedural           ACP
Area Control Surveillance         ACS


Rating Endorsement Abbreviations

Air Control                       AIR
Automatic Dependent Surveillance  ADS
Ground Movement Control           GMC
Ground Movement Surveillance      GMS
Precision Approach Radar          PAR
Radar                             RAD
Surveillance Radar Approach       SRA
Terminal Control                  TCL
Tower Control                     TWR

Licence Endorsement Abbreviation
On-the-Job Training               OJT
```

Current abbreviated ratings and endorsement(s) should be entered in the Rating/Endorsement(s) column of the Current Ratings/Endorsements, on page 5 of the licence.

Conclusion

The PMC contains sufficient elements to conclude that the OJTI licence endorsement was addressed by the PMC in accordance with ESARR 5 requirements.

The analysis provided above in comparison to the PMC does not raise any issue.

3.1.4   Issue d)

AMC Statement

"PMC is acceptable to meet the ESARR 5 medical requirements, only if used in conjunction with appropriate class of medical requirements and only if supplemented with detailed procedures at unit level to prevent licence holders to exercise their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances."

Proposed Modifications

Issue d) has to be split into two:

i)   PMC is acceptable to meet the ESARR 5 medical requirements, only if used in conjunction with appropriate class of medical requirements.

ii) PMC is acceptable to meet the ESARR 5 medical requirements, only if supplemented with detailed procedures at unit level to prevent licence holders to exercise their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances.

In the fist case, the issue is dealt with in the SRC DOC 28 'Assessment of the EATM Requirements for European Class 3 Medical Certification of Air Traffic Controllers, Edition 1.0 as an Acceptable Means of Compliance with ESARR 5, Edition 2.0.'

Based on the assessment in SRC DOC 28 the PMC is acceptable to meet ESARR 5 medical requirements when taken in conjunction with EATM Requirements for European Class 3 medical certification of air traffic controllers, Edition 2.0.

In the second case, the issue remains due to the fact that there is no modification included in the PMC to reflect this. As such, the PMC shall be supplemented with procedures to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances.

Conclusion

The PMC contains enough elements to conclude that used in conjunction EATM Requirements for European Class 3 medical certification of air traffic controllers, Edition 2.0 meets ESARR 5 medical requirements.

PMC is considered acceptable to meet ESARR 5 requirements only if supplemented with procedures to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances.

3.1.5 Issue e)

AMC Statement

"The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the unit training plans requirements in ESARR 5, only if the unit training plans developed according to the PMC guidelines are then submitted for approval to the Designated Authority."

Proposed Modifications

The EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers proposed the following modification to address this issue:

Modification 1 - Insertion in Section 8.4 Training at ATC Units, para 8.4.1. Unit Training Plan, Requirement (8.4.1.1) of new text (page 45, see text in red)

"8.4.1.1 Requirement

Every Unit must have a Unit Training Plan, approved by the Designated Authority, which will detail the processes by which student air traffic controllers and/or trainee air traffic controllers are trained. Additionally, the plan should detail the standards which will enable the objective of providing a safe air traffic control service to be met."

Analysis

The modifications proposed are according to the recommendations made before in Part I of this document.

> **Conclusion**
>
> The PMC contains enough elements to conclude that unit training plans are submitted for approval to the Designated Authority, complying with ESARR 5 requirements.
>
> The analysis provided above in comparison to the PMC does not raise any issue.

3.1.6   Issue f)

AMC Statement

"The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the OJTI requirements in ESARR 5, only if ATS units will have established procedures with the Designated Authority to notify whenever an OJTI is no longer competent to provide On-The-Job Training."

Proposed Modifications

The EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers proposed the following modification to address this issue:

Modification 1 - Insertion in Section 9.4 OJTI Requirement of new text (page 51, see text in red)

"9.4.1. Requirement

When an OJTI is no longer competent to provide On-the-Job Training the Designated Authority shall be notified accordingly, so that the licence endorsement may be revoked, suspended or varied, as necessary following due enquiry.

9.4.2. Guidance

The Designated Authority should ensure that ANSPs have procedures to assess the on-going competence of OJTIs to provide On-the-Job Training."

Analysis

The modifications proposed are according to the recommendations made before in Part I of this document.

> **Conclusion**
>
> The PMC contains enough elements to conclude that OJTI requirements in ESARR 5 are covered by the new text proposed above.
>
> The analysis provided above in comparison to the PMC does not raise any issue.

3.1.7   Issue g)

AMC Statement

"The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the requirements for the air traffic services units in ESARR 5, only if ATS units will have established procedures with the Designated Authority to notify whenever an air traffic controller fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing experience."

Proposed Modifications

The EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers proposed the following modifications to address this issue:

__Modification 1 - Insertion in Section 9.1 Rating Competence, 9.1.1 Requirement of new text (page 49, see text in red)__

"9.1.1. Requirement

Before a rating is issued, competence in that rating must be demonstrated.

Units shall require controllers to complete a minimum amount of operational controlling time in each of their valid ratings sufficient to enable them to maintain their competence in those ratings.

Units must have training procedures, which include emergency training.

Before a student air traffic controller is granted a valid ATC licence and associated rating he must be assessed as competent by an authorised person.

Trainee controllers, already holding an ATC licence, will have to demonstrate their competence to make their rating/ratings valid on additional positions in the same Unit or at another Unit.

The licence of an air traffic controller who does not continue to meet the competence requirements for a particular rating shall be varied by suspending that rating.

The process by which competence is to be assessed shall be fully documented indicating the method by which competence will be judged; that is, by continuous assessment, by an examination or by a combination of both.

Assessment for competence shall be conducted when there is a representative traffic sample in respect of the traffic levels and the range of procedures to be used. Simulators may be used to augment the assessment of competence."

__Modification 2 - Insertion in Section 9.3 Current Experience, 9.3.1 Requirement of new text (page 50, see text in red)__

"9.3.1. Requirement

To maintain competence controllers shall be required to carry out a minimum amount of controlling time on each sector or operational position for which their ratings are valid.

ATS Units must notify the Designated Authority when a controller fails to satisfy the Unit procedures for ongoing competence, in order that the licence in question may be revoked, suspended or varied as required. Such action will be taken when, following due enquiry, it is shown to the satisfaction of the Designated Authority that such action is appropriate and no mitigating circumstances are found to exist."

Analysis

The modifications proposed are according to the recommendations made before in Part I of this document.

Conclusion

The PMC contains sufficient elements to conclude that ATS units have established procedures with the Designated Authority to notify whenever an air traffic controller fails to satisfy the unit procedures for ongoing experience in accordance with ESARR 5 requirements.

The analysis provided above in comparison to the PMC does not raise any issue.

3.1.8   Issue h)

AMC Statement

"The PMC can be considered acceptable to cover the requirements for air traffic controllers to be applied by the individual personnel (both licensed/certificated air traffic controller and student air traffic controller) in ESARR 5, only if Designated Authority will publish additional requirements to set-up an institutional framework to allow the individuals to report whenever there is any decrease in a licence/certificate of competence holder medical fitness which might render the holder unable to safely and properly exercise the privileges granted by his/her licence."

Proposed Modifications

The EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers proposed the following modification to address this issue:

Modification 1 - Insertion in Section 12.2 Student Air Traffic Controller and Air Traffic Controller Licence Holders of new text (pages 61 and 62, see text in red)

"12.2.1. Requirement

An air traffic controller shall not provide an air traffic control service unless he or she holds a valid medical certificate of the appropriate category.

A student air traffic controller or trainee air traffic controller shall not provide an air traffic control service under supervision unless he or she holds a valid medical certificate of the appropriate category.

The holder of a student air traffic controller or air traffic controller licence who fails a medical examination shall not provide an air traffic control service even though the previous medical certificate held may not have expired.

The holder of a student air traffic controller or air traffic controller licence who fails a medical examination or has any medical limitations or conditions placed on the medical certificate, shall notify the Unit management.

A licence holder who becomes aware of a decrease in his medical fitness that may render him unable to safely exercise the privileges of his licence shall inform Unit management.

Unit management must inform the Designated Authority when a licence holder has been assessed as medically unfit to provide an ATC service.

12.2.2. Guidance

Individual licence holders are responsible for ensuring they hold a valid medical certificate and may be responsible for arranging their own initial and renewal medical examinations. However, the Licensing Administration and/or operational Units may have procedures for advising licence holders when medical certificates are due for renewal and for arranging medical examinations. Whatever the procedures employed, States should clearly define where the responsibility lies.

Holders of air traffic controller licences shall have their European Class 3 Medical Certificates renewed or revalidated every two years. It is recommended that when the holders of air traffic controller licences have passed their fortieth birthday, the two-year interval specified above should be reduced to one year. The Designated Aeromedical Authority may require additional medical examinations at its discretion.

The Designated Aeromedical Authority should specify those medical examinations that it will require to conduct and those that may be conducted by other authorised aeromedical examiners.

The Licensing Administration should notify the administration procedures for applications for initial medical examinations and for renewal of medical certificates."

Analysis

The modifications proposed are according to the recommendations made before in Part I of this document.

Conclusion

The PMC contains enough elements to conclude that the requirements for air traffic controllers to be applied by the individual personnel (both licensed/certificated air traffic controller and student air traffic controller) from ESARR 5 are covered by the new text proposed above.

The analysis provided above in comparison to the PMC does not raise any issue.

3.1.9   Issue i)

AMC Statement

Additional procedures are required to be developed to meet the requirements in 5.2.1.17 referring to the temporary suspension of licence/certificate of competence.

Proposed Modifications

The EATM European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers proposed the following modification to address this issue:

Modification 1 - Insertion in Section 11.2 Withdrawal from duty of new text (pages 55 and 56, see text in red)

"11.2. Withdrawal from duty

Units have the authority to withdraw controllers from operational duty in the interests of safety and without prejudice; it does not indicate that a controller is not competent or was the cause of the incident or accident.

11.2.1. Requirement

A controller who is implicated in the cause of an incident or accident to aircraft to which he was providing an air traffic control service shall be withdrawn from duty and shall not provide an air traffic control service.

A controller who is assessed by the Unit competence scheme as not competent shall be withdrawn from duty and shall not provide an air traffic control service, except under the supervision of a qualified OJTI.

11.2.2. Guidance

The purpose of withdrawing a controller from duty is to give the Unit time to conduct a preliminary investigation of the controller's role in the incident or accident. It also provides time for the controller to recover from the stress of the incident which could adversely affect his controlling efficiency.

If the Unit investigation concludes that the controller was not implicated in the cause of the incident or accident he should be returned to operational duty.

If the Unit investigation concludes that the controller was implicated in the cause of the incident or accident the controller shall remain withdrawn from duty and the Unit should inform the Designated Authority.

Where a controller is withdrawn from operational duty because the Unit competence scheme has determined that he is not competent the Unit should conduct a review. This review should determine if the competence scheme has been correctly implemented and that its conclusions are correct. It should also determine if the controller is not competent in a particular rating or endorsement or is not competent to provide any air traffic control service.

A controller who is not competent:

   a) in a particular rating, must not provide an air traffic control service associated with that rating;
   b) in a particular endorsement, must not provide an air traffic control service associated with that endorsement;
   c) to provide an air traffic control service must not provide any air traffic control service.

A controller may continue to provide the air traffic control services in the ratings and endorsements in which his competence is not in doubt.

Note:

The above does not limit in any way the Designated Authority's rights and/or responsibilities to revoke, suspend or vary an air traffic controller's licence or certificate of competence if deemed necessary on sufficient grounds after due inquiry (ref. 11.3 and 11.4 hereafter)."

Analysis

The modifications proposed are according to the recommendations made before in Part I of this document.

Conclusion

The PMC contains enough elements to conclude that procedures referring to the temporary suspension of licence/certificate of competence are addressed through the proposed text.

The analysis provided above in comparison to the PMC does not raise any issue.

3.2 Issues Raised in Part III of EAM 5 / AMC 1

3.2.1 Issue

Statement

"The generic example of a unit training plans presented in Guidance Material on Implementation of European Manual of Personnel Licensing (ref. HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01 Edition 1.0, August 2001) is considered an acceptable example and guidance to develop local unit training plans."

Analysis

The statement above provides sufficient guidance to air traffic units to start the development of the local unit training plans. As such, the statement is considered useful to be maintained in the future versions of EAM5 AMC document.

Conclusion

The PMC contains sufficient elements to conclude that it is useful to be maintained within future versions of the Statement of Compliance.

The analysis provided above in comparison to the PMC does not raise any issue.

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

4. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1 General

This section aims at summarising the analysis of the acceptability of the PMC as a means to show compliance with ESARR 5.

4.2 Conclusion 1

Based on the analysis of the issues in Part I of EAM 5 / AMC 1, this assessment concludes that;

The acceptability of the PMC in relation to ESARR 5 and the first Statement of Compliance (EAM 5 / AMC 1) is subject to exclusive applicability for Air traffic Controllers and not to all ATM Services' Personnel undertaking safety-related tasks.

Recommendation 1:

The PMC is subject to exclusive applicability for Air traffic Controllers and not to all ATM Services' Personnel undertaking safety-related tasks.

4.3 Conclusion 2

Based on the analysis of the issues in Part I of EAM 5 / AMC 1, this assessment concludes that;

The PMC does not detail the necessary medical requirement to be followed by air traffic controllers. This is provides by the EATM Requirements for European Class 3 medical certification of air traffic controllers, Edition 2.0. The assessment of the latter is provided within SRC DOC 28 which is concluded as acceptable.

Recommendation 2:

The PMC has to be used in conjunction with EATM Requirements for European Class 3 medical certification of air traffic controllers, Edition 2.0 to meet ESARR 5 medical requirements.

4.4 Conclusion 3

Based on the analysis of the issues in Part I of EAM 5 / AMC 1, this assessment concludes that;

The PMC does not provide for procedures to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances. This is not provided by the EATM Requirements for European Class 3 medical certification of air traffic controllers, Edition 2.0 which only establishes the medical requirements to be met by air traffic controllers when undertaking their duties.

Recommendation 3:

The PMC is considered acceptable to meet ESARR 5 requirements only if supplemented with procedures to prevent licence holders exercising their licence privileges while unfit or under the influence of psychoactive substances.

4.5 Conclusion 4

Based on the analysis of the issues in Part III of EAM 5 / AMC 1, this assessment concludes that;

The PMC provides a generic example of a unit training plan which is presented in Guidance Material on Implementation of European Manual of Personnel Licensing. This is considered an acceptable example and guidance for the development of the local unit training plans.

Recommendation 4:

The statement provided within Part III of EAM 5 / AMC 1 shall be maintained as a benefit in the development of local unit training plans.

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

APPENDIX A - LIST OF REFERENCE DOCUMENTS

PART 1

- EUROCONTROL Safety Regulatory Requirement – ESARR 5 "ATM Services' Personnel", Edition 1.0, November 2000.
- Safety Regulation Commission Document – SRC DOC 5 "Consistency Between ESARR 5 and ICAO SARPS – Annex 1", Edition 1.0. November 2000.
- EATMP "European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01), Edition 1.0, September 2000.
- EATMP "European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers – Guidance on Implementation", (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01) Edition 1.0, September 2001.
- EATMP "Air Traffic Controller Training At Operational Units" (HUM.ET1.ST05.4000-GUI-01) Edition 2.0, June 99
- EATMP "Air Traffic Controller Training at operational Units –Refresher Course" (HRS/TSP-004-GUI-01), Edition 1.0 August 2001.
- EATMP "Guidelines for Common Core Content and Training Objectives for Air Traffic Controllers Training - (Phase I: revised)" (HRS/TSP-002-GUI-01)
- EATMP "Guidelines for Common Core Content and Training Objectives for Air Traffic Controllers Training – (Phase II: Rating Training) (HUM.ET1.ST05.1000-GUI-02), Edition 1.0, February 2000.
- Safety Regulation Commission Document: SRC DOC 9 "Process for Establishing Acceptable Means of Compliance with ESARRs", Edition 1.0, June 2001.
- SRC Working Paper 5.5 "Safety Regulatory Commission Requirements Framework", SRC5, June 1999.
- SRC Working Paper 10.9 "Further ESARR Developments", SRC10, February 2001.
- SRC Working Paper 10.24 "ATCO Licensing Implementation Questionnaire" & Attachment to WP24
- SRC Working Paper10.26 "ESARR 5 – Draft Implementation Programme"
- EATMP Human Resources Team - HRT 15th Meeting (27-29 MARCH 2001) FINAL REPORT

PART 2

- EUROCONTROL Safety Regulatory Requirement – ESARR 5 "ATM Services' Personnel", Edition 2.0, April 2002.
- EAM 5/ICAO "Consistency Between ESARR 5 and ICAO SARPS", Edition 2.0. July 2005.
- EATM "European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-01), Edition 2.0, July 2006.
- EATM "European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers – Guidance on Implementation", (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-GUI-01) Edition 1.0 August 2001.
- EATM "Requirements for European Class 3 Medical Certification of Air traffic Controllers" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-STD-02) Edition 2.0, February 2006
- EATM "Consistency between requirements for European Class 3 Medical Certification of Air Traffic Controllers and ICAO SARPs Annex 1" (HUM.ET1.ST08.10000-REP-01), Edition 2.0 July 2006.
- ICAO Annex 1 Personnel Licensing
- ICAO DOC 8984 AN/895 Manual of Civil Aviation Medicine, second edition 1985
- EATMP ATCO Development Training - OJTI course (HRS/TSP-004-GUI-06, Edition 1.0, 8th April 2004)
- EATM ATCO Development - OJTI Refresher course (HRS/TSP-004-GUI-01, Edition 1.0, 10th August 2001

APPENDIX B - TERMS AND DEFINITIONS

Term	*Definition*
Acceptable Means of Compliance (AMC)	An acceptable means of compliance illustrates a means, or several alternative means, but not necessarily the only possible means, by which a requirement can be met
Accident	*An occurrence associated with the operation of an aircraft which takes place between the time any person boards the aircraft with the intention of flight until such time as all such persons have disembarked, in which:* *a) a person is fatally or seriously injured as a result of:* *- being in the aircraft, or* *- direct contact with any part of the aircraft, including parts which have become detached from the aircraft, or* *- direct exposure to jet blast,* *except when the injuries are from natural causes, self-inflicted or inflicted by other persons, or when the injuries are to stowaways hiding outside the areas normally available to the passengers and crew; or* *b) the aircraft sustains damage or structural failure which:* *- adversely affect the structural strength, performance or flight characteristics of the aircraft, and* *- would normally require major repair or replacement of the affected component* *except for engine failure or damage, when the damage is limited to the engine, its cowlings or accessories; or for damages limited to propellers, wing tips, antennas, tires, brakes, fairings, small dents or puncture holes in the aircraft skin; or* *c) the aircraft is missing or is completely inaccessible.* *Note 1.-For statistical uniformity only, an injury resulting in death within thirty days of the date of the accident is classified as a fatal injury by ICAO.* *Note 2.- An aircraft is considered to be missing when the official search has been terminated and the wreckage has not been located.*
Assessment	*An evaluation based on engineering, operational judgement and/or analysis methods.*
ATC Service	A service provided for the purpose of: a) Preventing collisions: 1) between aircraft and 2) on the manoeuvring area between aircraft and obstructions, and b) expediting and maintaining an orderly flow of air traffic
ATM Service	A service for the purpose of ATM.
ATM Service Provider	An organisation responsible and authorised to provide ATM service(s).

Term	Definition
Air Traffic Service	*A generic term meaning variously flight information service, alerting service, air traffic advisory service, air traffic control service (area control service, approach control service or aerodrome control service)*
Air Traffic Controller Licence	A document that identifies a person as a qualified Air Traffic Controller and contains personal, medical and professional qualifications including details of ratings, endorsements and current competence/validity
Air Traffic Management (ATM)	The aggregation of ground based (comprising variously ATS, ASM, ATFM) and airborne functions required to ensure the safe and efficient movement of aircraft during all appropriate phases of operations
ATM Services Personnel	Persons assigned to perform duties directly in connection with the provision of Air Traffic Management Services
Certificate of Competence/Competency	An expression used in ESARR 5 with the same meaning as the expressions "certificate of competency and license", "licence or certificate" and "license" used in ICAO Annex 1 and the Convention on International Civil Aviation
Competence in doubt	*A generic term covering variously situations when controller's has been involved in an incident or accident where the safety of aircraft was compromised, or is determined by the unit's competence scheme to be not competent or fails to comply with unit procedures relating to ongoing experience requirements*
Designated Authority	*The competent body designated by State authority, responsible for aviation safety regulation* *NOTE: In terms of ESARR 5 it is understood that the Designated Authority definition encompass the responsibilities of the currently Licensing Authority defined in ICAO Annex 1*
Endorsement	An entry in an ATC licence indicating the air traffic control unit and the operational positions or sectors at which a controller may exercise the privileges of the valid rating or ratings included in the ATC licence.
Incident	*An occurrence, other than an accident, associated with the operation of an aircraft, which affects or could affect the safety of operation.*
Licence endorsement	An authorisation entered on an air traffic controller licence and forming part thereof , stating a specialist qualification associated with the valid ratings in the licence
Medicines	Term covering prescription and non-prescription drugs
On-the-Job Training (OJT)	The integration in practice of previously acquired job related routines and skills under the supervision of a qualified On-the-Job instructor in a live traffic situation
Operational Training	Training given in the operational work situation and following institutional training. It comprises transition training, pre-OJT and OJT training

Term	*Definition*
Proposed Means of Compliance (PMC)	Any means proposed as an acceptable means of compliance to meet the provisions of a requirement. In the context of this document, the expression "the PMC" refers to the EATMP Safety Policy when implemented in accordance with its related Implementation Guidance Material.
Psychoactive substances	Alcohol, opioids, cannabinoids, sedatives and hypnotics, cocaine, other psycho-stimulants, hallucinogens and volatile solvents, whereas coffee and tobacco are excluded
Rating	An authorisation entered on or associated with a licence and forming part thereof, stating special conditions, privileges or limitations pertaining to such licence
Rating Endorsement	An authorisation entered or associated with a rating and forming part thereof, stating special conditions, privileges or limitations pertaining to such rating
Safety achievement	*The result of processes and/or methods applied to attain acceptable or tolerable safety*
Safety objective	*A safety objective is a planned safety goal. The achievement of an objective may be demonstrated by appropriate means to be determined in agreement with the safety regulator*
Safety Requirement	*A risk mitigation mean, defined from the risk mitigation strategy that achieves a particular Safety Objective. Safety requirements may take various forms, including organisational, operational, procedural, functional, performance, and interoperability requirements or environment characteristics*
Unit Training Plan	A plan required by the State, created by an operational ATC unit and approved by the Designated Authority, to provide structured objective based training so that personnel may achieve and maintain validation standard thus satisfying the requirements of the unit competence scheme.

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

APPENDIX C - BACKING EVIDENCE FOR PMC

At its 10 meeting SRC had received a copy of the questionnaire developed by HUM and SRU in order to gather additional areas where support might be needed during ESARR 5 implementation.

The Air Traffic Controller (ATCO) Licensing scheme detailed in the "European Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers" has been developed by EUROCONTROL as proposed best practice (according to the proposed EUROCONTROL Standardisation Framework in terms of Recommended Procedures and Practices) for a licensing system for ATCOs in ECAC States, with a view towards maximising safety. Its provisions have been extensively used in drawing up the safety requirements of ESARR5. It is currently being assessed by the Safety Regulation Commission (SRC) as a suitable means of compliance with the ESARR5 requirements (and is expected to be accepted as such). The manual is also mentioned in ESARR5 Guidance Material as valuable reference documentation for the implementation of ESARR5.

In order to assist licensing administrations as far as possible in implementing the terms of the Licensing Manual the EUROCONTROL DIS/HUM Unit has supplied a questionnaire entitled "EUROCONTROL Safety Regulatory Requirement ESARR 5 and Air Traffic Controller Licensing" in order to:

- Analyse the intentions and commitment of State Licensing Authorities to implement the proposed licensing scheme;

- Highlight areas where particular problems may be encountered in implementation;

- Determine in what areas, and to what extent, EUROCONTROL can provide, or seek to make available, assistance to facilitate implementation;

- Maintain an overview of progress in ATCO licensing implementation in ECAC states.

A complete copy of the questionnaire is to be found in the Attachment to SRC Working Paper 10.24 "ATCO Licensing Implementation Questionnaire".

Summary of the Questionnaire on ATCO Licensing Implementation

Section 1 of the questionnaire covers Implementation of the Requirements of ESARR 5, looking into:

- If is it clear what ESARR5, with respect to the requirements for Air Traffic Controllers, requires States/Organisation to do;

- If Is it clear how the requirements and guidance in the Manual of Personnel Licensing - Air Traffic Controllers enables States/Organisations to satisfy the requirements of ESARR 5;

- If States already licence air traffic controllers;

- If a licensing scheme based on the requirements described in the Manual of Personnel Licensing - Air Traffic Controllers will be implemented;

- If a licensing scheme based on the requirements described in the Manual of Personnel Licensing - Air Traffic Controllers is not implemented, how it is intended to meet the requirements of ESARR 5;

Section 2 of the questionnaire covers:

Section 2.1. the administration of the licensing scheme as laid down in the Manual of Personnel Licensing, looking at indicators such as:

- Development a high level regulatory structure to enable the implementation of the requirements of ESARR 5 and the Manual of Personnel Licensing – Air Traffic Controllers;

- Drafting supporting legislation, or modifications to existing legislation;

- Producing documentation for the conduct and administration of regulatory activity;

- Training of regulatory administrative staff

Section 2.2. the ATCO competence scheme, looking at indicators such as:

- Developing an ATCO competence scheme;

- Providing documented guidance to units on the application of the ATCO competence scheme;

- Implementing an ATCO competence scheme;

Section 2.3. the ATCO training, looking at indicators such as:

- Setting and documenting requirements for unit training and assessment;

- Developing and documenting unit training plans;

- Implementing unit training plans;

- Training of competency assessors/examiners

- Developing guidance to enable initial training institutions to provide courses which meet ECAC Training Guidelines for Common Core Content

- Developing guidance for the staged introduction of new training courses

Section 2.4. the ATCO medical requirements, looking at indicators such as:

- Developing regulatory policy for medical certification;

- Implementing of the EUROCONTROL proposals for new medical requirements as laid out in the document "Requirements for European Class 3 Medical Certification of Air Traffic Controllers";

- Developing procedures for the introduction of the regulation of psychoactive substances;

(Space Left Intentionally Blank)

Section 3 of the questionnaire tries to gather additional info related to the areas in which support is needed.

Summary of the Results of the Questionnaire on ATCO Licensing Implementation

General:

Questionnaires sent	38
Replies received	23
- safety regulators	10
- service providers	6
- combined replies	4
- both	2
- licensing authority	1

Section 1

- Currently license ATCOs	17
- State employees	6
- Intend to implement	90%

Section 2 - Yes

- Administration	90%
- competence scheme	100%
- training	90%
- medical requirements	90%

Section 3

- staff shortage;
- request for documentation;
- assistance in various aspects of training;
- request for workshop;
- development and application of competence scheme;
- regulatory policy for medical certification.

(***)